

## CHAPTER ONE

### INTRODUCTION

#### 1. Background of Study

One of the Catholic teachings is the eternal life after death. Whether it is a place of eternal happiness called heaven or eternal torture, which is called hell. In addition, this faith also teaches where a place available between heaven and hell called Purgatory.<sup>1</sup> For centuries, it has been researched in many various ways; as religion doctrine, agreed beliefs, as theology and eschatology, as social and intellectual history, as literature, art, and folklore.

From time to time, the Catholic Church has inherited one of the truths of faith called Purgatory. Sometimes the problem of faith and beliefs are related to human reason which is very limited to explain it and it feels like something is offended and still not perfect in its explanation and description.

The doctrine of Purgatory has gone through a process of formation during the middle ages and has been the center of thought a number of theologians who have joined it as an important part of the Church's teachings on repentance and forgiveness. However, the doctrine of Purgatory faith has been interpreted by various variations because it has not yet known the authenticity of its history. This is also one of the causes of internal and external conflicts between the Churches of Greece and Rome.<sup>2</sup> The church is using Purgatory as well to build the system of indulgences which then generate significant financial resources. At the end of 15<sup>th</sup> century and 16<sup>th</sup> century especially, the Roman Pope was involved in more political affairs than clergy and Church was assumed corruption, which led to Christian beliefs about the need to reform the Church.<sup>3</sup> Hence the birth of several

---

<sup>1</sup> L. Benedictus Giuseppe-Maria, *Api Penyucian Kesaksian Orang Kudus*, (Bogor: OBOR, 2017), p. Xii.

<sup>2</sup> Jacques Le Goff, *The Birth of Purgatory*, (Germany: Scholar Press, 1990), p . 5.

<sup>3</sup> Alister E. McGrath, *Sejarah Pemikiran Reformasi*, (Jakarta: BPK Gunung

reformist movement under the influence of the humanist mind began to develop a reflection on the justification and possibility of someone like an individual, to get justification before seeing the God. This teaching was not clear in the Church at that time, and so among Protestant movements find an effort to present his own interpretation. This is the cause of all the doctrines of Purgatory in the Catholic Church are the one that historically has attracted the greatest hostility from Protestant. Thus, Protestant tried to get answers to the questions of forgiveness and the reaction to Church practices encouraged Protestants to define their attitude against the doctrine of Purgatory because the implementation of indulgences could erase previous sins.<sup>4</sup>

In the book of 'The Birth of Purgatory', a brilliant medieval historian and famous Anneles historian named Jacques Le Goff, does not concerned about the theological discussion but with the growth of relations between beliefs and ideas of the community, mental structures, and with historical roles and imagination. He agreed that the doctrine of Purgatory did not appear in Latin theologians in the West before the 12<sup>th</sup> century, that the word Purgatory did not exist until then. He also pointed out that the belief between heaven and hell is closely related to major changes in social reality and intellectual of the middle ages. In this study, the researcher will explain more about the question of thought and understanding if his writing and further elaborate the phenomenon of the birth of the doctrine of Purgatory.

Calvin and Luther paid special attention to Protestant main objections to the teachings of Purgatory,<sup>5</sup> which were never taught in the Bible. They have appointed a number of passages that are considered to support the teachings, and argue that after being interpreted appropriately, the passage actually does not teach Purgatory. In addition, the main basis for rejection is the notion of safety (soteriology) and the notion of Christ (Christology).

---

Mulia, 2016), p. 39.

<sup>4</sup> John Casey, *After Lives a Guide to Heaven, Hell & Purgatory*, (New York: Oxford University Press, 2009), p. 225.

<sup>5</sup> Jerry L. Walls, *Purgatory*, (New York: Oxford University Press, 2012), p. 34.

According to Calvin, Purgatory is contrary to the teaching that believers are saved entirely by faith in Christ's actions. The view that suffering after death is necessary for final salvation degrades the invaluable price of Christ's suffering and death.

Death is inevitable and will be approached for every life and existence in the universe, because it is the truth to the nature of man whether he is a believer or not. Indeed, it is something that can be felt, seen, and let alone heard by all mankind.<sup>6</sup> Thus, the question arises what happens to the human soul in Purgatory and how do we avoid it.

Because of the breadth of this research, the researcher is not possible to analyze in detail all the theological arguments and text created by the Protestant for controversy or rejection of Purgatory, for the reason of research concentrated on several key texts, and events that have influenced the development of learning in Catholic Church.

## **2. Problem Formulation**

According to Rev. F. X. Schouppe, a main problem in this study is that Purgatory has been long forgotten by the majority of faithful believers.<sup>7</sup> Human today are very uncertain about the status associated with their doctrine, and wondered the questions about Purgatory. To narrow down this discussion and the title more concentration, the researcher has adjusted the formulation of the problem below:

- a. What is the concept of Purgatory in Catholicism?
- b. What is the view of Protestant and Orthodox Christian regarding Purgatory?

---

<sup>6</sup> Abdul Muhsin al-Muthairi, *Buku Pintar Hari Akhirat*, (Jakarta: Zaman, 2012), p. 73.

<sup>7</sup> Rev. F.X Schouppe, S.J, *The Dogma of Purgatory*, (London: Burns & Wasbourne LTD, 1920), p. v.

### **3. Purpose and Significance of Study**

#### **A. Purposes**

- a. To know the concept of Purgatory in Catholicism.
- b. To find out the views of Protestant and Orthodox Christians regarding the concept of Purgatory.

#### **B. Significance of Study**

##### **a. Theoretical Benefits**

1. In the academical field, the researcher hopes that this research can provide more understanding about Purgatory in Catholicism and also the views of other religions.
2. The researcher hopes that this thesis is able to enrich the information regarding the differences between Catholic and Protestant views on Christian Theologian.
3. The results of this research can be useful and beneficial to the development of knowledge further.

##### **b. Practical Benefits**

1. This thesis was written to ensure the Christians Catholic that the Purgatory is the biblical root of sensible teaching and to emphasize the faith about it.
2. This thesis is expected to show how can the Christians Catholic avoid the Purgatory by using the means God has so generously offered them.
3. This thesis is written to maintain the doctrine, dogma and the teachings of any religion's view, especially the concept of Purgatory.

#### 4. Literature Review

After the researcher held review of the literature, then he picked up from several sources and some existing writings, hence the author has discovered several specific papers that discuss and there is a connection with this research:

*First, The Presentation of Purgatory in a Colonial Painting from Latin America.*<sup>8</sup> A thesis that is written by Rafael Alas Vasques, Master of Art. Here the author describes the presentation about Purgatory in painting that was very popular after the Council of Trent, meanwhile, Protestant rejected the existence of Purgatory. Instead, the Catholic Church with the help of the religious commandments and brotherhood, kept the devotion to the souls who suffer. During the colonial period in Latin America, this devotion gained a unique interest and this fact is reflected in many paintings that represent Purgatory which are often displayed on cathedrals and churches. The aim of the study was to study the iconography of one of these paintings representing Purgatory. This painting was also chosen from figures such as St. Peter and St. Michael.<sup>9</sup> Meanwhile, study approach used by the author is Theological Approach because it asks the belief of several bishops, nuns and black men about the picture of Purgatory.<sup>10</sup> The result of this study, the researcher found that the doctrine of Purgatory applies to the Catholic Church after the Council of Trent.<sup>11</sup> The difference between this paper and the topic of author is that the researcher combines the rejection of Purgatory in Christian beliefs. The conclusion of thesis above is that the researcher will add a deeper description rather than just looking at the pictures that state it is a picture in Purgatory.

#### *Second, Dispute Over Catholic and Protestant Notions of Purgatory*

---

<sup>8</sup> Undergraduate thesis presented to The University of Maryland, United State of America for the degree, 1990.

<sup>9</sup> *Ibid*, p. i.

<sup>10</sup> *Ibid*, p. ii.

<sup>11</sup> *Ibid*, p. 69.

*in the 16th Century*.<sup>12</sup> A thesis written by Martin Rocek, Faculty of Philosophy, Institute of World History. This thesis focuses on Catholic and Protestant disputes about Purgatory in 16th century. The purpose of this study was to analyze the differences in perspective on the scriptures and the reasons that led to the Protestant theologians rejecting the doctrine of Purgatory. Therefore, what need to be discussed is the opinion originating from Protestant and Catholicism, that the German movement and Swiss reform occurred after several centuries later.<sup>13</sup> In this paper, there are no examples of the arguments in the Bible that explain the Purgatory. So, the researcher compares using the theorems in the Scriptures. The conclusion of the thesis above, the researcher will add the arguments that are explained in the Bible to prove the concept of Purgatory is truly written and not only arises from the mind of a theologians.

*Third, Purgatory and “Toll Houses”*: *The Discussion in an Interim Post-Modern Condition in Orthodox Theology*.<sup>14</sup> A study written by Valdas Mackela dam Gintaras Sungaila, Faculty of Theology and Philosophy. In addition to the eschatological doctrine of the state of heaven and hell, the Catholic Church has also developed the Purgatory. The purpose of this study is to bring the doctrine of the Orthodox Church closer to Purgatory which is called “toll houses”. This article also analyzes the context of the debate within the Orthodox Church with its heavenly Gnostic journey and Catholic doctrine of Purgatory. The study approach used is the theological approach because hypothetically, the assumption is that the teaching of “celestial habits” has similarities with the teachings of the Catholic Church with Purgatory.<sup>15</sup> The results if this paper is that in Orthodox teaching

---

<sup>12</sup> Undergraduate thesis presented to Univerzita Karlova v Praze, Ceska Republika for the degree, 2016.

<sup>13</sup> *Ibid*, p. 5.

<sup>14</sup> Undergraduate thesis presented to Vytautas Magnus University, Lituania for the degree, 2016.

<sup>15</sup> *Ibid*, p. 10.

there is a prayer for the dead, which presupposes until the final trial.<sup>16</sup> The comparison with this study is that the Protestant view of Purgatory does not affected and pray for the dead. The conclusion of his discussion above is no concept of “toll-houses” which teaches us to pray for the souls of the dead. Here the researcher will analyze more in the view of the two concepts between the camps.

## 5. Theoretical Framework

The theoretical framework is an approach that is used to look at problems and conclude a study, which is a logical and systematic temporary explanation of the phenomenon under investigation.<sup>17</sup>

Globally, the concept of Purgatory in a famous historical perspective is a place called “third place” not only heaven and hell.<sup>18</sup> Through this Purgatory, the process of purifying God’s love will be carried out as explained in 1 Corinthians 3 verses 10 to 15.<sup>19</sup> Actually, the concept of Purgatory is something that is believed by the Church and the Apostles in the golden age of Christianity.

Purgatory is a place that is typical of Catholicism. This unique place is not found in other belief systems.<sup>20</sup> There is much debater about the existence of Purgatory. The first arguments are that there is no biblical basis for this belief as criticized by John Calvin and the rejection of Protestant. His view that the death of Christ has provided complete redemption for human sins. According to him also, if one agrees that the blood of Christ is the only atonement for sins of the believer, the only scarification, the only savor, is

---

<sup>16</sup> *Ibid*, p. 22.

<sup>17</sup> Dewi Sadiyah, *Metode Penelitian Dakwah*, (Bandung: Remaja Rosdakarya, 2015), p. 70.

<sup>18</sup> Jacques le Goff, *The Birth of Purgatory*, (England: Scholar Press, 1990), p. 2.

<sup>19</sup> 1 Korintus 3:15, *Alkitab Perjanjian Baru*, (Yogyakarta: Penerbit ANDI OFFSET), p. 445.

<sup>20</sup> L. Benedictus Giuseppe-Maria, *Api Penyucian Kesaksian...*, p. xii.

enough for him to be saved from all the torments on the day of vengeance.<sup>21</sup> Such is the difference of opinion in Catholicism and Protestant. Finally, researchers try to explore the basic things that contain differences between them in the theological aspects.

Before proceeding further, the researcher uses a theoretical framework to identify the problems discussed worthy of investigation, analysis and acceptance by investigators. Since the title of this research is related to religion, the researcher implies the Theological Approach as a scientific method.<sup>22</sup> In addition, this approach is an attempt to understand religion by using the divine framework as an opposing religion.<sup>23</sup> Therefore, the conclusion that could be the theory for this approach is Theological Cosmology because the Scriptures invites people to pay attention and think about the creation of the universe, because there are signs of God's existence and power.

God has spoken His word in the Bible; therefore, this type of approach will identify everything He says in the Scriptures, analyze each relevant message, extract the main principles as propositions and theological methods to calculate all data. Furthermore, to achieve some epistemic goals, this capital is needed to be a method as a systematic guide.<sup>24</sup>

---

<sup>21</sup> Albertus Purnomo, OFM, *Riwayat Api Penyucian Dalam Kitab Suci dan Tradisi*, (Yogyakarta: PT Kanisius, 2017), p. 202.

<sup>22</sup> Scientific Method is a process use to validate observation while minimizing observer bias. Its goal for research to be conducted in a fair, unbiased and repeatable manner. Maria Ryan, Angela O'Callaghan, *The Scientific Method University of Nevada*, (Fact sheet-02-66)

<sup>23</sup> Abuddin Nata, *Metodologi Studi Agama Islam*, (Jakarta: RajaGrafindo Persada, Ed. 18, 2011), p. 28.

<sup>24</sup> Milos Kosterec, *Analytical Method*, (Department of Logic and Methodology of Science, University in Bratislava, 2015), p. 84.

## 6. Research Methodology

### 6.1 Types of Research

To inform, readers and researchers themselves, this research uses literature research to show that the researcher follows the development of the topic he is researching. According to Prof. Dr. Afrizal, M.A, problematic research must be supported by several pawns from journals, articles and books.<sup>25</sup> This is the opportunity for researcher to search for data and information from any books and articles found in bookstore, libraries, or even from search engines. In addition, this data must be related to topics such as concepts, doctrines, ideas, and so on.

Critical and dialogical research must be carried out in this research to obtain results that satisfy the results of research in which researcher must comment and interpret ideas, concepts and arguments. After all data is collected, qualitative research will be applied by the researcher because he will analyze it from word to word (oral or written) without trying to calculate it.<sup>26</sup>

#### 6.2.1 Data Sources

In this study, the researcher applied several very valuable and important books to get good results. It is also divided into primary and secondary sources,

#### 6.2.1 Primary Sources

To emphasize more about this research, the researcher found many books related to all the concepts of Purgatory and its doctrines.

---

<sup>25</sup> Afrizal, *Metode Penelitian Kualitatif*, (Jakarta: PT RajaGrafindo Persada, 2016), p. 122.

<sup>26</sup> *Ibid.* p. 13.

**a) *The Dogma of Purgatory***; written by Rev. F.X Schouppe, S.J and published by Burns, Oats & Wasbourne LTD in London, 1920. This book describes various phenomena that he has just noticed to recognize souls in Purgatory. This book also describes the vision of Purgatory which has been given to many holy souls and become dogma.

**b) *The Birth of Purgatory***; which was written by Jacques le Goff and published by Scholar Press, 1990. The book argues that the doctrine of Purgatory did not appear in Latin theology in the West before the end of the 12th century, that the word Purgatory did not exist until then.

**c) *The Biblical Basis for Purgatory***; which was written by John Salza and published by TAN Books, 2009. This book explains the biblical basis for Purgatory by examining the relevant Scriptural text and writings and interpretations of the Church Fathers. It also inspires the reader to live holy lives and avoid purgatory.

**d) *Purgatory Philosophical Dimension***; book written by Kristof KP Vanhoutte and Benjamin W. McCraw and published by Springer International Publishing in Cham, Switzerland, 2017. This book examines the concept of Purgatory and collects papers by philosophers and other scholars involved mainly philosophical arguments, debates and dialogues which involves the Purgatory conception and related ideas. It is there to expand the discussion beyond the prevailing trends in academic literature and fill important intellectual; gaps.

**e) *Heaven Can't Wait, Purgatory in Catholic Devotional and Popular Culture***; written by Diana Walsh Pasulka and published by Oxford University Press in New York, 2014. In this book, he offers a very important historical exploration of the concepts of space and material Purgatory, starting with the scholastic theologian William from Auverge and Thomas Aquines, who wrote about location of Purgatory and question whether the torture is physical or merely spiritual.

**f) *Hamlet in Purgatory***; written by Stephen Greenblatt and

published by Princeton University Press in England, 2013. This book explains the doctrine of Purgatory and the complex practices that the developed around it, the church has provided a powerful method for negotiating with the dead. The protestant attack on Purgatory destroyed this method for most people in England in the mid- 16th century.

**g) *After Lives a Guide to Heaven, Hell & Purgatory***; written by John Casey and published by Oxford University Press in New York, 2009. This book answers all the most influential questions we face as humans are our death and our eternal relationship.

**h) *Heaven's Purge, Purgatory in Late Antiquity***; written by Isabel Moreira and published by Oxford University Press in New York, 2010. This book discusses the various influences that play a role in the initial formation of Purgatory, including ideas about punishment and correction in the Roman world, slavery, medical value cleaned up in people's temples holy, and the visionary authority of the hereafter to inform the afterlife Christians.

**i. *Riwayat Api Penyucian Dalam Kitab Suci dan Tradisi***; written by Albertus Purnomo, OFM and published by PT Kanisius in Yogyakarta, Indonesia, 2017. This book can be a summary of ideas and thoughts from many traditions and the leading church about Purgatory because there are too many different views.

**j) *Api Penyucian Kesaksian Orang Kudus***; written by L. Benedictus Giuseppe-Maria and published by OBOR in Bogor, Indonesia, 2018. This book explains the knowledge and understanding of reality after death. It also helps witnesses and stories told by saints who adorn several rights God willing to see and experience suffering in Purgatory.

### 6.2.2 Secondary Sources

About this source, the researcher collects some additional

information all about connections or relating to research obtained from books, journals, magazines, and other articles, to understand more about Purgatory in Catholicism.

### 6.2.3 Data Collection Techniques

Every human being has a tendency to see what they want to see and hear, and do anything just to fulfill their desires. So, researchers will use the literature review method to collect data systematically with standard procedures and can measure variables on the topic.<sup>27</sup>

Thus, the observation method will be supported after reading many books, journals and library tool as an emphasis on documentation and technique also allows the researcher to examine the definition of each variables, and observe the information in the description provided.<sup>28</sup>

### 6.3 Data Analysis Methods

To analyze data, the researcher uses two methods to study this topic. The method used are descriptive method and analytical method.

#### 6.3.1 Descriptive Method

In order to complete this research, the researchers used descriptive methods. This is a method used to find relevance about the purpose of research, to describe the situation of the phenomenon in detail to provide complete information.<sup>29</sup>

The researcher will use this method because it can be clarified as merely an attempt to determine, describe or identify variables on the topics discussed. Researches use this method to describe a fact and the characteristics of an object or subject that is precisely examined systematically. In addition, it has

---

<sup>27</sup> Andra Tersiana, *Metode Penelitian*, (Yogyakarta: Start Up, 2018), p. 118.

<sup>28</sup> Barbara B. Kawulich, "*Parcitiptant Obsevation as a Data Coleection Method*", [http://www.qualitative\\_research.net/index.php/fqs/article/view/466/996](http://www.qualitative_research.net/index.php/fqs/article/view/466/996), accessed on: May 2005.

<sup>29</sup> Aslam Sumhudi, *Kompotisi Disain Riset*, (Jakarta :CV. Ramadhani, 1991), p. 44.

been emphasized by Mr. Abuddin Nata that this type of method describes the fundamental terms of the whole subject, individual characteristics, circumstances, phenomena in society.<sup>30</sup> Thus, this method must be applied to describe and explain the whole study of the Concept of Purgatory in Catholicism, as well as conflicting Protestantism.

### 6.3.2 Analysis Method

While the method of analysis tries to determine why this is or how it happened. According to Milos Kosterec, he proved in the compilation of the institute of Philosophy, SAS journal, that the knowledge of researchers would be enlarged without crossing the logical closure of that knowledge to use analytical methods.<sup>31</sup>

In addition, another use of this method is to obtain, decode and make explicit information that is hidden, encoded or inserted by information in a preexisting knowledge base. With this method, the researcher can analyze the word Purgatory from books and references to compare the true meaning of it because some say Purgatory is a place where souls are purified before meeting God and some say Purgatory is a place for punishment and some say it is the place of unfortunate souls who need prayers from people who are still alive and others.

## 7. Systematics Discussion

In this study, the researcher clarifies into four chapters that are connected and related to each other. The following are:

### Chapter One

This chapter is an introduction, consisting of background, problem formulation, research objectives and benefits, literature

---

<sup>30</sup> Abuddin Nata, *Metodologi Studi Islam...*, p. 118.

<sup>31</sup> *Ibid.* p. 84.

review, theoretical framework, research methodology, systematical discussion, and reference.

## **Chapter Two**

This chapter explains each variable in this study, between Purgatory and Catholicism. This includes the basic definitions and foundations of Purgatory to give deeper insight into how these ideas exist. In addition, he revealed the history of Purgatory and Catholicism from time to time and its development for centuries.

## **Chapter Three**

This chapter focuses on the issues discussed based on the background of the study including the teaching of Purgatory in Catholicism. This includes an explanation of verses in the Bible and some evidence that the concept of Purgatory is indeed discussed in the Bible and as a church tradition, dogma or maybe just a doctrine, in addition to a description of the soul in it and how to avoid Purgatory. However, these types of concepts and ideas caused contradictions between Heresy Group, the Greek Church and the Protestant. So, in this chapter also, the researcher presents the ideas of groups or individuals who are in conflict with Purgatory. Therefore, this is the most important chapter for solving learning problems and for this research itself.

## **Chapter Four**

Closing, this chapter contain the results of the research or conclusions the researcher made after researching and understanding the whole discussion. In addition, the researcher will give some basic suggestions and recommendations based on his beliefs.