

BUKTI KORESPONDENSI

ARTIKEL JURNAL NASIONAL TERAKREDITASI

Judul Artikel : Stakeholders Approach in Halal Tourism Development Strategy: A Case Study in Ponorogo District
Jurnal : Ekuilibrium: Jurnal Ilmiah Bidang Ilmu Ekonomi, Vol. 17 No. 2 (2022)
Penulis : Muhammad Ridlo, Dhika Amalia Kurniawan, Fajar Surya Ari Anggara

No.	Perihal	Tanggal
1.	Bukti konfirmasi submit artikel dan artikel yang disubmit	3 Agustus 2022
2.	Bukti konfirmasi review dan hasil review pertama	8 Agustus 2022
3.	Bukti konfirmasi artikel accepted	6 September 2022

1. Bukti Konfirmasi Submit Artikel dan Artikel yang Disubmit (3 Agustus 2022)

The screenshot shows a Gmail interface with the following details:

- Search:** Ekuilibrium
- Subject:** [Ekuilibrium] Unsuitable Submission (External)
- Sender:** Rochmat Aldy Purnomo <ojsuomop1999@gmail.com>
- Date:** Wed, Aug 3, 2022, 9:59 AM
- Body Text:**

Assalamu'alaikum Warahmatullahi Wabarakatuh

Kami ucapkan terimakasih kepada Bapak/Ibu author yang telah berpartisipasi pada penerbitan **Ekuilibrium** edisi September 2022. Berdasarkan hasil evaluasi tahap pertama terhadap 60 lebih artikel yang masuk, berikut kami sampaikan 13 artikel yang lolos ke tahap review.

Artikel yang tidak masuk ke tahap review mohon maaf otomatis REJECT. Besar harapan kami Bapak/Ibu dapat berpartisipasi kembali di penerbitan yang akan datang. Terimakasih

Wassalamu'alaikum Warahmatullahi Wabarakatuh

Rochmat Aldy Purnomo
ekuilibrium@umoo.ac.id / WA 089910830501

Stakeholders Approach in Halal Tourism Development Strategy: A Case Study in Ponorogo District

Muhammad Ridlo Zarkasyi¹, Dhika Amalia Kurniawan²,

¹University of Darussalam Gontor, Indonesia, ridlo@unida.gontor.ac.id

²University of Darussalam Gontor, Indonesia, dhika.amalia@unida.gontor.ac.id

ABSTRACT

Halal tourism is a tour under sharia principles, a set of additional services of amenity, attraction, and accessibility aimed and provided to meet Muslim tourists' experiences, needs, and desires. But there is still a gap in understanding of halal tourism. In Bali, halal tourism is merely connoted as an extended package of tours, the same as the demand for other tour packages, such as vegetarian tour packages. In other countries, notably those whose citizens are the majority of the non-muslim population, develop halal tourism, which commonly only try to create a Muslim-friendly atmosphere. Among tourism stakeholders, the understanding of halal tourism is still uneven, causing suspicion, prejudice and low interest in organizing halal tourism. Many tourists have not been interested in the halal tourism industry because of their lack of understanding. It is required to adjust the understanding of the meaning and concept of halal tourism among stakeholders and its technical component explanation in detail according to the characteristics of halal tourism destinations by building a dynamic understanding using a shared activity approach. Stakeholder Theory identifies stakeholders' interests in tourism activities and measures the level of its influence on halal tourism programs further to determine the type of empowerment in sustainable programs. The researchers identify stakeholder existence with its importance and measure halal tourism programs. They obtained the following order: managers of tourist attractions, tourists, local governments, restaurants/cafes, food producers, religious colleges, hotels and activists of cultural arts, communities and travel agencies. Local governments and tourism managers (tourist attractions, restaurants, food producers) who often differ in opinion are the main parties influential in halal tourism. They are encouraged to form an association similar to a "corporation" to build the concept of halal tourism mutually agreed upon. This is to make it easier for other stakeholders to behave and develop a shared understanding. The concept is further used as a mindset in preparing stakeholder empowerment programs. Stakeholder empowerment is carried out in a sustainable program, including; providing transparent information, consulting for consideration, providing opportunities for engagement, collaborating, and empowering. Then, the agenda of forming a mindset and introducing the concept of halal tourism includes in empowerment program. It is realized by collaborating and synergizing to package halal tourism and create a new business model of it. Local governments can utilize this stakeholder empowerment program to clarify their role in the concept and implementation of halal tourism. So that they can make the regulation acceptable to all parties and take sides more to the market, as one of the efforts to improve the concept of reinventing government in their environment.

Keywords: halal tourism, stakeholder theory, stakeholder empowerment, and reinventing government

I. INTRODUCTION

Tourism is a person's effort to meet the need for entertainment and knowledge because tourists hope to live life outside of daily life, increase knowledge and get entertainment after travelling. According to (Hartono & Wijayanto, 2019) , tourism is a travel activity done by a person or group of people to visit a tourism destination in a temporary period. Halal tourism is a term that develops from the previous terms friendly tourism, halal travelling, Sharia tourism and finally halal tourism (Sapta Nirwandar, 2020)

The contribution of the Muslim-friendly tourism sector or Halal tourism toward economic growth over the past five years has considerably increased in line with tourism in general. Both from its contributions to GDP, foreign exchange receipts, the arrival of foreign Muslim tourists, and domestic tourist travels all show a positive trend (Sofyan et al., n.d.). According to *The State Global Islamic Economy Report 2020*, Indonesia is ranked as the fifth-largest outbound Muslim travel country after Saudi Arabia, UAE, Qatar, and Kuwait. Indonesia has natural and cultural attractions related to the Islamic world, which is ready to develop into a halal tourist destination (Salam Gateway, 2020).

However, there is still a gap in understanding of halal tourism, specifically the refusal to carry the theme of halal tourism in Bali and also other regions (DW, 2019), which makes halal tourism only as an extended package of tours, the same as the demand for other tour packages, such as vegetarian tour packages. Similarly, observed from the concepts and principles of halal tourism that exist in non-Muslim countries, especially, generally just trying to create a Muslim-friendly atmosphere (Satrian & Faridah, 2018).

In general, the problems faced in the development of halal tourism according to the ministry of tourism and creative economy include: Indonesia is dominated by the Muslim population, the majority of tourism stakeholders are Muslims making the tourism auto-halal, so there is no need to learn to be halal (Prodjo, 2016). This means that the facilities and infrastructures of tourism are all halal because of the Muslim majority population; there is no need to innovate and certify.

So that it can be said there is no conscious tourism mindset of Indonesian society. From the results of The Discussion Focus Group with tourism business doers in Ponorogo, there are some objections to the development of halal tourism, such as carrying halal tourism reduces the interest of tourists. Then, the addition of investment in facilities, permits and halal certification as well is difficult to fulfil by tourism business doers.

The phenomenon in Bali and Ponorogo implies that the management of tourist destinations has suspicion on the theme of halal tourism, as identified by (C & Prayag, 2020), the development of halal tourism, which ultimately demands halal certification, standardization and promotion schemes, is suspected of being used for the achievement of a narrow political agenda, commercial interests and private economy, protectionism and trade competitiveness, and other exceptions.

The diversity of halal tourism understanding, according to (Ishak, 2019), can be difficult and become an obstacle in the development because each tourism business doer has not found the same concept about the application of halal tourism. (Alim et al., 2008) Concluded that the Government need to give special emphasis related to Sharia tourism. Many business doers have not been interested in this industry because of their lack of understanding pertaining to halal tourism

Therefore, according to (Sayekti, 2019) socialization is needed by the community and stakeholders so that the same perception is built about halal tourism developed by the government. This socialization can also emerge public awareness to improve service and hospitality to welcome tourists.

The government has done socialization about halal tourism. Nevertheless, because it concerns the perspective or fundamental mindset and attitude toward halal tourism, thus there are still steps and concrete actions needed, especially from the Government, as a Public Service, to involve all stakeholders in realizing the concept and regulation of halal tourism.

Stakeholder theory, initially used by company management in looking at and behaving towards stakeholders, is a stakeholder empowerment strategy to support the company's goals in the long term. This theory can be used by local governments together with tourism managers and parties who care about halal tourism as one of the mindset change strategies carried out continuously.

II. LITERATURE REVIEW

Halal tourism is an additional set of amenities, attractions, and accessibility services aimed at and provided to meet Muslim tourists' experiences, needs, and desires, (Yahya, 2019). The concept of halal tourism first appeared in 1997. Mohsin and Ryan wrote a study, namely writing the Concept of Muslim-friendly attractions, during a visit to Australia from Malaysia and Indonesia (Ismail et al., 2019).

(Puad et al., 2016) defines halal tourism as Islamic tourism, and it can also be defined as tourism done primarily by Muslims, although it can include non-Muslims who are motivated to travel by Islam, which takes place in the Muslim world. The objectives are: first, the revival of Islamic culture and the spread of Islamic values; second, the economic benefits to the Islamic community; and third, strengthen the confidence, identity and Islamic belief to face negative stereotypes compared to other cultures and lifestyles.

Sharia tourism which is popularly interpreted as Halal tourism, is a tour in accordance with sharia principles (Majelis Ulama Indonesia, n.d.). Furthermore, (Anonymous, 2018) provides completeness signs with several halal tourism components, namely:

- Halal hotel: with key indicators of Islamic hotels including no alcohol, no gambling, etc.; Only halal food; Quran, prayer mats, and arrows indicating the direction of Mecca in every room; Beds and toilets are positioned not to face toward Mecca; prayer room; conservative staff clothing; Islamic funding; Separate recreational facilities for men and women.
- Halal Transportation (Airline): Key indicators of halal transportation include: cleanliness, non-alcoholic beverages, and publications in line with Islam.
- Halal Food Place: Food served in the restaurant must be halal. All animals must be slaughtered in accordance with Islamic principles. Alcoholic beverages should not be performed in this place.
- Halal Tour Packages: The contents of the tour package must be based on an Islamic theme. Islamic tour packages include visits to mosques, Islamic monuments and promotions and events during Ramadan.
- Halal Finance: The financial resources of hotels, restaurants, travel agents and airlines must be in accordance with Islamic principles. In general, Islamic finance requires participation in the sharing of profits and losses among all parties involved in this financing company. Islamic finance also prohibits interest.

Referring to the conclusion of (Kusumaningrum et al., 2017), from Korea's experience developing halal tourism, it can be concluded that South Korea's interest in building a Muslim-friendly country's image is 1) to increase public income and investment, 2) to look for alternatives to domestic market development so as not to depend on China as an export destination, and 3) to strengthen cooperation and diplomatic relations with Muslim countries, as a geopolitical strategy. Likewise, socialization and implementation of the concept of halal tourism in Indonesia, which is successfully carried out, can establish the concept of halal tourism in halal tourism stakeholders, making the travel experience, especially for foreign tourists, memorable. The satisfaction of foreign tourists will strengthen the relationship between the tourism place and the country where tourists come from. The comfort and tourist experience can be helpful to invite investors.

Halal tourism policy is also a manifestation of tourism aimed at strengthening friendship between nations as one of the tourism destinations, (Santoso et al., 2020). The tourists from the Middle East is a prospect for potential tourists in the future, the level of shopping and travel outbound are quite high. Middle Eastern markets remain attractive to Indonesia because they have the potential to spend high quality. (Widagdyo, 2015) states that tourists from the Middle East vary significantly in terms of psychographic aspects. Several types and characteristics of tourists from the Middle East were identified, including Business people and professionals, Middle and Upper-Class Tourists, Youth and Students, and Traders.

It is necessary for all stakeholders to understand and socialize Sharia compliance practices with all aspects of tourism in the tourism competitiveness index. From the conclusion of some research findings, there is an opportunity for the local area and tourism stakeholders to create a halal tourism concept that all stakeholders can accept according to the context of the tourism object and its area.

Halal Tourism Development Strategy by Public Organizations

According to (Wegrich, n.d.), public organizations are part of an economic system controlled by national, state or provincial, and local governments. A public organization is a local government mandated by the Ministry of Tourism and Creative Economic to develop halal tourism.

Nowadays, Public Organizations have been enhanced by the concept of Reinventing Government, an effort to increase public sector productivity with 10 principles of reinventing government expressed by (Osbor & Gaebler, 1996) . According to (Wijayanto et al., 2013) there are still two implementations of reinventing government principles that have not been fulfilled, namely: a) Decentralized Government; b) Market-Oriented Government.

Provincial or Regency / City Governments who have established halal tourism as one of the destination development main icons are encouraged: a. To draft policies on halal tourism. b. To create a database to support the certification of halal tourism products and businesses and the development of halal tourism, which can be accessed by halal tourism stakeholders, (Yahya, 2019). Thus, the Ponorogo Regency government can draw up regulations and policies in developing halal tourism. The emphasis on the regulation and policy accentuate halal tourism market orientation.

The explicit role of local governments in the concept and implementation of halal tourism will make regulations more acceptable and taking sides to the market. It is also profitable for halal tourism stakeholders to provide a high-value halal tourism experience among Muslim tourists. When halal tourism is carried on successfully, it will open great opportunities for the local area to get investors in other various business fields through halal tourism activities. The benefits of halal tourism can be a booster for local governments to develop with stakeholders.

Stakeholder Theory

According to (Freeman, 1984), A stakeholder is any group or individual who can influence or be influenced by the achievement of organizational goals. Stakeholders have diverse interests. Therefore they must be addressed and controlled by management. According to Freeman, the concept of "Stakeholder Management" refers to the need for organizations to manage relationships with specific stakeholder groups in an Action-oriented manner. This management core consists of 3 stages; Identify who the stakeholders are and what their interests are, understand how the organization's processes communicate with stakeholders and understand a series of transactions or bargains between the organization and its stakeholders.

The organization is said to have high or superior stakeholder management capabilities if it meets the following criteria: (Freeman, 1984)

- understanding the stakeholder map and the interests of each group,
- having a process which routinely has standard operating procedures for an organization to account for the groups and their interest.
- Implement a series of transactions or bargains to balance the interest of stakeholders to achieve organizational goals.

A stakeholder is divided into two categories: internal stakeholder within the organization and external, outside the organization. An external stakeholder is more difficult to identify its interests and influence in succeeding or disrupting the implementation of organizational performance achievement strategies. The nature of the relationship with the organization for stakeholders outside the organization is generally the involvement of stakeholders. This type of engagement, according to (Bryson, 2004) was chosen from five approaches; providing transparent information, consulting for consideration, providing opportunities for employment, collaborating, empowering.

Stakeholder Concept

The company is founded by someone as a business pioneer with the initial capital he owns. Then, it develops in need of additional money, which involves investors who invest their capital in exchange for shares or company ownership. The company's strategy was originally structured with the principle of providing maximum profits to investors. Because the company is also required to be able to continue to operate and provide benefits in the long term, the company must also care about the business related to the company's operations either directly or indirectly, such as; raw material suppliers, product distributors, product selling agents, and creditors. To sum up, the stakeholder theory originated from this understanding.

The basic idea of stakeholder theory is quite simple. (Edward Freeman et al., 2007) state that understanding business means knowing how relationships between stakeholder groups work. The job of an executive or entrepreneur is to manage and form those relationships, which is termed as managing stakeholders—starting from helping to provide clarity to managers about the stakeholders' characteristics

and behaviour in order to avoid mistakes in acting. Furthermore, it helps to clarify the relationships and contributions of stakeholders in achieving the company's objectives, making it easier to determine the scale of service priorities to stakeholders.

Program for Stakeholder

Strategies selected based on a strategic issue, then implemented by the organization, will be influenced by the organization's internal and external stakeholders. Stakeholder programs are not only accommodating stakeholder interests, but also must be able to support the organization strategic programs. (Edward Freeman et al., 2007), quoting Lorange, pointing out four strategic program foundations in connection with stakeholders: Existing programs for stakeholders; New programs for stakeholders; Programs to improve Current Operating Efficiency; Support Program for Other Stakeholder Relationships.

III. METHODOLOGY

The study approach is qualitative whose output produces a tourism development strategy from the stakeholder side. Data is compiled from interviews, photos, and other official documentation relevant to tourism conditions (Aziz et al., 2020). The data processing technique goes through a series of processes with focus group discussions (FGD) involving parties related to tourism in Ponorogo Regency. The object in question is the Tourism Office and destination managers in Ponorogo Regency (East Java) and related stakeholders.

IV. DISCUSSION

4.1. Halal Tourism Concept

The purpose of providing halal tourism for tourism managers is to introduce Islamic values and culture; economic benefit for Islamic society; (Puad et al., 2016). For tourists, religion is one of the crucial factors in the decision-making process of traveling; they also ensure the availability of Islamic attributes in the destination and service, (Suid et al., 2017).

The aim of halal tourism and the tourist interests to get entertainment and travel which is guaranteed halal are the main factors to make the concept of halal tourism in Indonesia. Understanding halal tourism can be widely accepted between tourists and tourist destination managers with stakeholders around it. However, it cannot only be approached by relying on the government's definition. According to (Awalia, 2017), in the theory of commodification, whoever is able to commodify discourse will get complete control over the object of his power. Understanding halal tourism dominated by the Government can not be separated from political interests and partisanship toward specific communities, which will cause jealousy and social conflict that will threaten the integrity and unity of the region. In turn, there can't be an equal understanding among stakeholders toward halal tourism.

The concept of halal tourism is still not the same. Each tourism doer has not found the same concept about the application of halal tourism. This can make the development of halal tourism difficult (Ishak, 2019). Efforts are needed to build the understanding dynamically among halal tourism stakeholders to provide halal tourism and have a halal tourism conscious attitude compactly.

The understanding of tourism stakeholders about tourism has become a mindset which is awakened with years of experience. Their understanding of halal tourism as a new theme requires a change in mindset. So that an interactive understanding is needed and built continuously between the concept of tourism and various aspects of religion which is done together with halal tourism stakeholders.

As (Zarkasyi, n.d.) says that mindset is strong and its change can be sudden and transformative due to an event. An event that can trigger a change in mindset is an enormous event experienced by a person. That event may be awe-inspiring, so it can fundamentally change the beliefs or values in someone's mind. So understanding the concept of halal tourism is not enough to rely on socialization. Still, it must be followed

by involvement to carry out activities together, which will form a memorable experience. Then intensive dialogue is conducted to be able to change the stakeholder's prejudice, value and belief.

Stakeholder theory aims to manage stakeholder interests to be in accordance with the company's strategic objectives in the long term. It will practically make the managers easier to behave, help clarify stakeholder relationships and contributions in achieving company goals, making managers easier to determine the scale of service priorities to stakeholders.

The difference in understanding the concept of halal tourism, which is often found, is the difference between tourism business doers and regulators in the Ministry of Tourism and Creative Industries and local governments. To build a common understanding, the two parties are directed to create the same views, even joining together in a group similar to a "corporation", and representing as a unit "corporation" for those outside them.

For halal tourism doers, the government initially, as an external stakeholder, functionally in the context of communication, turns into an internal stakeholder. For local governments, "a corporation" is a form of innovation that will give birth to a mindset of "thinking from within the company" or growing a mentality as a business doer. This mindset is necessary to be owned by all local governments. It is in line with strengthening the concept of reinventing government which in turn will result in policies and regulations readily accepted by halal tourism doers and supported by tourists also a strategic step that can be taken to build an understanding of halal tourism to the community and business doers are to carry out stakeholder empowerment in the framework of halal tourism development, as follows:

4.2. Halal Tourism Stakeholder Identification

Halal tourism has several stakeholders who have been involved and have not been involved in tourism in general. Ponorogo Regency has a cultural icon in the form of Reog Ponorogo, a traditional art known to foreign countries. In the world of Education, there are 7 private universities, including Darussalam Gontor University, known among international academics and religious scholars. The Cultural Group and Religious Academics are influential in growing the aspiration of halal tourism stakeholders in Ponorogo.

Suppose halal tourism is able to drive the regional economy. In that case, halal tourism stakeholders are all actors of economic activities, even halal observers outside economic actors, such as universities or fatwa institutions. The stakeholders and their interest scores on halal tourism are: (Results of Focus Group Discussion and Interview with stakeholders)

Table 1: Stakeholder Interests and their Influence Scores on Halal Tourism

No	Stakeholder	Interest - Score	Quality	Score
1	Hotel	providing halal services without the loss of other consumers – 7	0,1	0,7
2	Restaurant/cafe	increased turnover, on top of the costs incurred for certification – 8	0,1	0,8
3	Food	increased turnover, on top of the costs incurred for certification – 8	0,1	0,8
4	Tourism Object	the attraction of the tourism object is still in demand by all tourists, although the theme is halal tourism - 9	0,15	1,35
5	Art, Culture	Creating halal events for tourists to enjoy, without overhauling indigenous art and culture – 7	0,1	0,7

No	Stakeholder	Interest - Score	Quality	Score
6	Travel	halal tourism can increase the number of tourists who can be managed – 7	0,05	0,35
7	Religious University	developing the concept and science of halal tourism for academic purposes and in order to contribute in making policy and controlling its implementation – 8	0,1	0,8
8	Local government	developing halal tourism, to popularize and advance the area and increase regional revenues – 9	0,1	0,9
9	Society	given the opportunity to interact with foreign tourists, can contribute to halal tourism with the potential, not just as a passive supporter - 9	0,05	0,45
10	Tourist	enjoying friendly, the ease of worship and the clarity of the halal. - 10	0,15	1,5

Based on the table above, it can be sorted that stakeholder interests to be accommodated in halal tourism programs are: Tourist Attractions, Tourists, Local Government, Resto / Café, Food, Religious Colleges, Hotel and Cultural Art Activists, Communities and Travel Tours.

Accuracy in identifying stakeholders and uncovering their interests will make it easier for the tourism manager and local government to create stakeholder empowerment programs that are acceptable and useful in achieving the corporation's strategic goals. The realization of the concept of halal tourism agreed upon by all stakeholders is comprehensive and can be functioned in the long term, which can be the foundation of all halal tourism policies and regulations imposed.

4.3. Empowerment of Halal Tourism Stakeholder

The principle of the empowerment concept is the involvement of stakeholders proportionally, according to the level of influence on the operation of halal tourism business, it starts from the creation of halal tourism concept, regulation-making, and halal tourism operational activities. Halal tourism business managers hold empowerment of stakeholders in accordance with their interests and potential with local governments as a corporation. In the Bryson category, it can be done in several ways: providing clear information, consulting for consideration, providing opportunities for engagement, collaborating, and empowering.

The interest of these stakeholders can be addressed in their respective ways. In essence, it provides opportunities or memorable experiences to all stakeholders in halal tourism activities in proportion. Empowerment by direct involvement in halal tourism programs can inspire a synergy between stakeholders. Activities carried out together where intensive communication between stakeholders can eliminate stakeholder prejudice against the interests of local governments and form the correct mindset about halal tourism. The involvement of these stakeholders can be done in the following ways.

1. Tourism object manager; involved in drafting regulation, provided with information about existing regulation; given the opportunity to promote in all local government media and stakeholder media; collaborating with transportation managers for the promotion of tourism object; Synergizing between tourism object manager to provide a more memorable experience and a longer stay.
2. Tour package organizer, travel bureau; provided clear information about halal tourism; involved in promotion by the local government; managing synergy programs between tourism destination; given the opportunity to initiate a new business model of halal tourism.

3. Food and beverage business doer; Restaurant, food store, food maker; collaborating with tourism object manager; involved in the preparation of regulation by the local government; Empowered to be known by tourists.
4. Hotel Manager; involved in making rules; empowered to collaborate with universities; empowered to be able to provide the service for all tourists.
5. Tourist; promoted and virtualized as a tourist in ponorogo area, involved in providing a testimonial of halal travel experience; involved in the lover's community of halal tourism destination; appreciated and appreciated as a tourist, for example by pinned souvenir and other attributes.
6. College; provide religious, academic legitimacy about halal tourism; involved in policymaking and regulation; empowered in collaborating with halal tourism business doers.
7. The general public; empowered to uncover the tourism potential around it; given the opportunity to collaborate with tourism business manager; involved in the making of rules; Provided with information about halal tourism.
8. Local Government; can produce policy and regulation that regulate and succeed halal tourism; can carry out the concept of reinventing government by being allowed to be a catalyst in the empowerment of halal tourism stakeholders; playing a role in encouraging collaboration between stakeholders; involved in helping stakeholders to play a role in the halal tourism industry proportionally.

Understanding of halal tourism can be realized in the company's attitude in managing stakeholder interest. They are building a shared understanding by running empowerment activities together in a participatory manner. Stakeholders are given the opportunity to carry out the necessary activities in the halal tourism program to explore their understanding of halal tourism, to be further combined with the understanding of "a corporation". This is considered strategic to measure the extent to which stakeholders feel their interests are accommodated by " a corporation". Empowerment programs that can accommodate stakeholders' interests will facilitate the establishment of a shared understanding of halal tourism, which ultimately maintains cohesiveness in the implementation of halal tourism regulation and policy.

4.4. Strategic Program for Halal Tourism Stakeholder

The entire empowerment activity can also be carried out in a series of programs that are carried out continuously, for example:

1. Program for Stakeholders; This program is a strategy that a company undertakes to manage relationships with its stakeholder.
2. New program for stakeholders; a new program which changes the way stakeholder relationship is handled, due to the new halal tourism program. Halal tourism can create new stakeholder groups and reposition public tourism by redefining the old stakeholder holding program.
3. Program to Improve Current Operating Efficiency; strategic programming makes the company more efficient in halal tourism with new stakeholder groups: capital investment program or improvement study in the halal tourism service process by involving more skilled Human Resources.
4. Support Program for Other Stakeholder Relationships; Support program is formulated to help a manager achieves goals. The program is integrative, which create a more favourable managerial climate.

The four types of programs make stakeholders close to halal tourism managers and create harmonization and togetherness in the development of halal tourism. Stakeholder support morally in halal tourism is indispensable. (Vargas-sanchez et al., 2020), stated the need for extra efforts to socialize and promote idolatry in tourism. Socialization is directed to the appreciation of the spiritual dimension that focuses on the inner wellbeing of society, compared to other dimensions, such as health and ecology, because the experience of its spiritual nature can be considered as the most necessary condition to support efforts to position Indonesia as a halal tourist destination country.

It is impossible if it is only carried out by the company managing halal tourism destination itself; the participation and support of stakeholder and the community are needed. The local government, which has become a "corporation" with halal tourism managers, can be the initiator of this stakeholder empowerment program, bridging the communication of tourism managers with the community or newly identified stakeholders due to the existence of the halal tourism theme.

The core of the program is the empowerment of stakeholders to understand halal tourism as a direction for tourism development in the future by involving them directly in halal tourism activities, not just listening carefully. Empowerment is carried out together in a "corporation", namely halal tourism business managers and local government. With this strategy, it is expected that stakeholder feels proportionally involved, and able to create a synergy of new sustainable program, in the form of a special program for halal tourism.

V. CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATION

1. The concept of halal tourism in accordance with the context of the area can be realized by minimizing differences in understanding of the concept of halal tourism between stakeholders. It starts with togetherness, especially between local government and tourism business doer in an organization that resembles a "corporation". The corporation is intended to avoid the dominance of commodification of halal tourism discourse by the government and tourism business doer unilaterally.
2. "Corporations" need to create an empowerment program for stakeholders to accommodate interests and behave toward stakeholders. This is expected to strengthen the understanding of halal tourism, which becomes the mindset of all stakeholders while inspiring the creation of a new business model of halal tourism by initiating collaboration and synergy between stakeholders.
3. Empowerment begins by identifying the existence, interest, and potential of stakeholders and measuring the influence level on halal tourism management operation. From the identification found six main stakeholders who are influential in halal tourism to be prioritized in empowerment program namely; Tourist Attraction Manager, Tourist, Local Government, Restaurant, Food manufacturer, Religious University
4. Stakeholder empowerment is carried out in a continuous program, including; providing transparent information, consulting for consideration, providing opportunities for engagement, collaborating, and empowering.
5. In the framework of Reinventing Government, Local Government, which is incorporated in a "corporation" can proactively be a catalyst to build a tourism conscious attitude and developing an understanding of the concept of raw halal tourism and empowerment for halal tourism stakeholders in their area, market-oriented.

REFERENCES

- Alim, H. T., Riansyah, A. O., Hidayah, K., & Muslim, I. (2008). *YOGYAKARTA*. 1–8.
- Anonymous. (2018). *Strategic Roadmap For Development Of Islamic Tourism In OIC Member Countries*. The Statistical, Economic and Social Research and Training Centre for Islamic Countries (SESRIK).
- Awalia, H. (2017). Komodifikasi Pariwisata Halal NTB dalam Promosi Destinasi Wisata Islami di Indonesia. *Jurnal Studi Komunikasi (Indonesian Journal of Communications Studies)*, 1(1). <https://doi.org/10.25139/JSK.V1I1.64>
- Aziz, N. A. B. D., Muslichah, I., & Ngah, A. H. (2020). *UNDERSTANDING FACTORS INFLUENCING COMMUNITY LIFE SATISFACTION TOWARDS SUSTAINABLE HERITAGE TOURISM DESTINATION : THE CASE OF YOGYAKARTA , INDONESIA*. 15(1), 37–51.

- Bryson, J. M. (2004). *Strategic planning for public and nonprofit organizations: a guide to strengthening and sustaining organizational achievement-3rd ed.* John Wiley & Sons, Inc.
- C, M. H., & Prayag, G. (2020). *The Routledge Handbook of Halal Hospitality and Islamic Tourism.* Routledge.
- DW. (2019). *No Title.* <https://www.tempo.co/dw/1487/salah-paham-seputar-wisata-halal>
- Edward Freeman, R., Harrison, J. S., & C., A. W. (2007). *Managing for stakeholders: survival, reputation, and success.* Yale University Press.
- Freeman, R. E. (1984). *Strategic management, A Stakeholder Approach.* Pitman Books Limited.
- Hartono, A., & Wijayanto, ©Punto. (2019). *Pedoman Pengembangan Wisata Sejarah dan Warisan Budaya.* KementerianPariwisata. moz-extension://7660aa79-e146-444d-8529-f6b01f5fda61/enhanced-reader.html?openApp&pdf=https%3A%2F%2Fwww.kemenparekraf.go.id%2Fasset_admin%2Fassets%2Fuploads%2Fmedia%2Fpdf%2Fmedia_1593566537_Buku_Pedoman_Pengembangan_Wisata_Sejarah_dan_Warisan_Budaya.pdf
- Ishak, A. (2019). PANDANGAN STAKEHOLDER PARIWISATA TENTANG HALAL. *Jurnal Ranah Komunikasi (JRK)*, 3, 69–81.
- Ismail, M. N., Othman, R., & Ismail, M. S. (2019). Halal tourism research bibliometric analysis in Scopus, ProQuest and Ebscohost / Mohd Nasir Ismail ...[et al.]. *Undefined.*
- Kusumaningrum, D. N., Fairuz, A. M., & Putri, E. P. (2017). *Trend pariwisata halal korea selatan.* 855–865.
- Majelis Ulama Indonesia. (n.d.). *Pedoman Penyelenggaraan Pariwisata Berdasarkan Prinsip Syariah.* 2016. Retrieved August 5, 2021, from <https://drive.google.com/file/d/0BxTl-INihFyzV0dPcEdtd0kwN2M/view?resourcekey=0-ZW0VKJGV2YqoVoRC4kuszg>
- Osbor, D., & Gaebler, T. (1996). *Mewirauahakan Birokrasi: (Reinventing Government), Mentransformasi Semangat Wirausaha Ke Dalam Sektor Publik.* Pustaka Binaman Pressindo.
- Prodjo, W. A. (2016). *No Title.* KOMPAS.Com. <https://travel.kompas.com/read/2016/08/06/170400727/Tiga.Hambatan.Pengembangan.Wisata.Halal.di.Indonesia>.
- Puad, A., Som, M., Masutani, S., & Ahmad, M. F. (2016). The Macrotheme Review A multidisciplinary journal of global macro trends The Growth of Muslim Friendly and Halal Tourism in Inbound and Outbound Travel Market. *The Macrotheme Review*, 5(5), 10–17.
- Salam Gateway. (2020). *State of the Global Islamic Economy 2020/21 Report.* <https://www.salaamgateway.com/specialcoverage/SGIE20-21>
- Santoso, L., Cahyani, Y. T., & Suryani, S. (2020). DILEMA KEBIJAKAN WISATA HALAL DI PULAU LOMBOK. *Jurnal Sosiologi Reflektif*, 15(1), 23–44. <https://doi.org/10.14421/JSR.V15I1.1968>
- Sapta Nirwandar. (2020). *Halal Tourism Itu Bukan Persoalan Agama an sich.* Bisnis Wisata.Co.Id. <https://bisniswisata.co.id/sapta-nirwandar-halal-tourism-itu-bukan-persoalan-agama-an-sich/>
- Satrian, E. D., & Faridah, H. D. (2018). *Wisata halal: perkembangan, peluang, dan tantangan.* 01(02), 32–43.
- Sayekti, N. W. (2019). STRATEGI PENGEMBANGAN PARIWISATA HALAL DI INDONESIA HALAL TOURISM DEVELOPMENT STRATEGY IN INDONESIA Sektor pariwisata merupakan salah satu program prioritas pembangunan Kabinet Kerja 2015-2019 di bagi Indonesia yang memiliki keindahan alam dan kekayaan se. 159–172.
- Sofyan, R., Ahmad, H., Rahtomo, W., Hidayat, N., Sari, C. A., Nursali, Y., Dewandaru, G., & Quraisy, M. (n.d.). *Laporan Perkembangan Pariwisata Ramah Muslim Daerah 2019-2020.* Komite Nasional Ekonomi dan Keuangan Syariah (KNEKS). <https://knks.go.id/storage/upload/1608113420-LaporanPerkembanganPariwisataRamahMuslimDaerah2019-2020.pdf>
- Suid, I. S., Ashikin, N., Nor, M., & Omar, H. (2017). *A Review on Islamic Tourism and the Practical of Islamic Attributes of Destination in Tourism Business.* 7(12), 255–269. <https://doi.org/10.6007/IJARBS/v7-i12/3609>
- Vargas-sanchez, A., Hariani, D., & Sanchez, A. V. (2020). *Perceptions of Halal Tourism in Indonesia : Mental Constructs and Level of Support Perceptions of Halal Tourism in Indonesia : Mental Constructs and Level of Support.* 8(4).
- Wegrich, K. (n.d.). *public sector.* Encyclopedia Britannica. Retrieved July 25, 2021, from <https://www.britannica.com/topic/public-sector>
- Widagdyo, K. G. (2015). ANALISIS PASAR PARIWISATA HALAL INDONESIA. *Tauhidinomics: Journal of Islamic Banking and Economics*, 1(1), 73–80. <https://doi.org/10.15408/THD.V1I1.3325>
- Wijayanto, I. H., Suryono, A., & Sukanto. (2013). Pengembangan Potensi Pariwisata Dalam Perspektif Reinventing Government (Studi Di Dinas Kebudayaan Dan Pariwisata Kabupaten Lamongan). *Jurnal*

Administrasi Publik Mahasiswa Universitas Brawijaya, 1(6), 1168–1173.

Yahya, A. (2019). *Panduan Penyelenggaraan Pariwisata Halal*. Kementerian Pariwisata.

Zarkasyi, M. R. (n.d.). *Entrepreneurship – Intrapreneurship, Untuk Kemandirian dan Kelestarian Bisnis*. UNIDA Gontor Press.

2. Bukti Konfirmasi Review dan Hasil Review Pertama (8 Agustus 2022)

The screenshot shows a Gmail interface on a Windows desktop. The browser address bar displays the URL: <https://mail.google.com/mail/u/0/#search/Ekuilibrium/FMfcgzGqPpgGlgQGmdGKQNFglxqbBzdD>. The search bar contains the word "Ekuilibrium".

The email being viewed is from Rochmat Aldy Purnomo (ojsuomop1999@gmail.com) to MUHAMMAD, me, and Fajar. The subject is "[Ekuilibrium] Editor Decision". The email is dated Monday, August 8, 2022, at 8:45 AM. A "Translate to English" button is visible above the text.

The body of the email contains the following text:

Assalamu'alaikum Warahmatullahi Wabarakatuh

Selamat siang Bapak/Ibu author, proses review artikel telah selesai dilakukan oleh reviewer dan editor. Bapak/Ibu author mohon untuk segera melakukan revisi dan melakukan cek plagiasi (maksimal 20%), hasil revisi dan cek plagiasi dikirimkan kembali via OJS paling lambat 1 minggu setelah pesan ini.

Terimakasih banyak atas kerjasamanya.

Wassalamu'alaikum Warahmatullahi Wabarakatuh

Admin Editor
Wizdan Choiriyah
ekuilbrium@umpo.ac.id/WA 08991083050

The Windows taskbar at the bottom shows the search bar with "Type here to search", several application icons (including Chrome, Firefox, and WhatsApp), and the system tray with the time 11:12 and date 03/10/2024.

Stakeholders Approach in Halal Tourism Development Strategy: A Case Study in Ponorogo District

ABSTRACT

Halal tourism is a tour under sharia principles, a set of additional services of amenity, attraction, and accessibility aimed and provided to meet Muslim tourists' experiences, needs, and desires. But there is still a gap in understanding of halal tourism. In Bali, halal tourism is merely connoted as an extended package of tours, the same as the demand for other tour packages, such as vegetarian tour packages. In other countries, notably those whose citizens are the majority of the non-muslim population, develop halal tourism, which commonly only try to create a Muslim-friendly atmosphere. Among tourism stakeholders, the understanding of halal tourism is still uneven, causing suspicion, prejudice and low interest in organizing halal tourism. Many tourists have not been interested in the halal tourism industry because of their lack of understanding. It is required to adjust the understanding of the meaning and concept of halal tourism among stakeholders and its technical component explanation in detail according to the characteristics of halal tourism destinations by building a dynamic understanding using a shared activity approach. Stakeholder Theory identifies stakeholders' interests in tourism activities and measures the level of its influence on halal tourism programs further to determine the type of empowerment in sustainable programs. [The researchers] identify stakeholder existence with its importance and measure halal tourism programs. They obtained the following order: managers of tourist attractions, tourists, local governments, restaurants/cafes, food producers, religious colleges, hotels and activists of cultural arts, communities and travel agencies. Local governments and tourism managers (tourist attractions, restaurants, food producers) who often differ in opinion are the main parties influential in halal tourism. They are encouraged to form an association similar to a "corporation" to build the concept of halal tourism mutually agreed upon. This is to make it easier for other stakeholders to behave and develop a shared understanding. The concept is further used as a mindset in preparing stakeholder empowerment programs. Stakeholder empowerment is carried out in a sustainable program, including; providing transparent information, consulting for consideration, providing opportunities for engagement, collaborating, and empowering. Then, the agenda of forming a mindset and introducing the concept of halal tourism includes in empowerment program. It is realized by collaborating and synergizing to package halal tourism and create a new business model of it. Local governments can utilize this stakeholder empowerment program to clarify their role in the concept and implementation of halal tourism. So that they can make the regulation acceptable to all parties and take sides more to the market, as one of the efforts to improve the concept of reinventing government in their environment.

Commented [I1]: The abstract seems to be too long

Commented [I2]: Pls clarify the research design. Is it a participatory action research?

Keywords: *halal tourism, stakeholder theory, stakeholder empowerment, and reinventing government*

I. INTRODUCTION

Tourism is a person's effort to meet the need for entertainment and knowledge because tourists hope to live life outside of daily life, increase knowledge and get entertainment after travelling. According to (Hartono & Wijayanto, 2019), tourism is a travel activity done by a person or group of people to visit a tourism destination in a temporary period. Halal tourism is a term that develops from the previous terms friendly tourism, halal travelling, Sharia tourism and finally halal tourism (Sapta Nirwandar, 2020)

The contribution of the Muslim-friendly tourism sector or Halal tourism toward economic growth over the past five years has considerably increased in line with tourism in general. Both from its contributions to GDP, foreign exchange receipts, the arrival of foreign Muslim tourists, and domestic tourist travels all show a positive trend (Sofyan et al., n.d.). According to *The State Global Islamic Economy Report 2020*, Indonesia is ranked as the fifth-largest outbound Muslim travel country after Saudi Arabia, UAE, Qatar, and Kuwait. Indonesia has natural and cultural attractions related to the Islamic world, which is ready to develop into a halal tourist destination (Salam Gateway, 2020).

However, there is still a gap in understanding of halal tourism, specifically the refusal to carry the theme of halal tourism in Bali and also other regions (DW, 2019), which makes halal tourism only as an extended package of tours, the same as the demand for other tour packages, such as vegetarian tour packages. Similarly, observed from the concepts and principles of halal tourism that exist in non-Muslim countries, especially, generally just trying to create a Muslim-friendly atmosphere (Satrian & Faridah, 2018).

In general, the problems faced in the development of halal tourism according to the ministry of tourism and creative economy include: Indonesia is dominated by the Muslim population, the majority of tourism stakeholders are Muslims making the tourism auto-halal, so there is no need to learn to be halal (Prodjo, 2016). This means that the facilities and infrastructures of tourism are all halal because of the Muslim majority population; there is no need to innovate and certify.

So that it can be said there is no conscious tourism mindset of Indonesian society. From the results of The Discussion Focus Group with tourism business doers in Ponorogo, there are some objections to the development of halal tourism, such as carrying halal tourism reduces the interest of tourists. Then, the addition

Commented [13]: It looks like a literature review instead of introduction. Introduction should focus on the urgency of the issue.

Commented [14]: This should be the first paragraph.

Commented [15]: This sentence has no structure.

Commented [16]: Pls check the author. Abbreviation is normally used for first and middle name instead of family name.

Commented [17]: This sentence has no structure, what is the main clause, what is the supporting clause?

Commented [18]: Every single word should begin with capital letter.

Commented [19]: Pls specify (how many participants, from which institutions)

of investment in facilities, permits and halal certification as well is difficult to fulfil by tourism business doers.

The phenomenon in Bali and Ponorogo implies that the management of tourist destinations has suspicion on the theme of halal tourism, as identified by (C & Prayag, 2020), the development of halal tourism, which ultimately demands halal certification, standardization and promotion schemes, is suspected of being used for the achievement of a narrow political agenda, commercial interests and private economy, protectionism and trade competitiveness, and other exceptions.

The diversity of halal tourism understanding, according to (Ishak, 2019), can be difficult and become an obstacle in the development because each tourism business doer has not found the same concept about the application of halal tourism. (Alim et al., 2008) Concluded that the Government need to give special emphasis related to Sharia tourism. Many business doers have not been interested in this industry because of their lack of understanding pertaining to halal tourism

Therefore, according to (Sayekti, 2019) socialization is needed by the community and stakeholders so that the same perception is built about halal tourism developed by the government. This socialization can also emerge public awareness to improve service and hospitality to welcome tourists.

The government has done socialization about halal tourism. Nevertheless, because it concerns the perspective or fundamental mindset and attitude toward halal tourism, thus there are still steps and concrete actions needed, especially from the Government, as a Public Service, to involve all stakeholders in realizing the concept and regulation of halal tourism.

Stakeholder theory, initially used by company management in looking at and behaving towards stakeholders, is a stakeholder empowerment strategy to support the company's goals in the long term. This theory can be used by local governments together with tourism managers and parties who care about halal tourism as one of the mindset change strategies carried out continuously.

II. LITERATURE REVIEW

Halal tourism is an additional set of amenities, attractions, and accessibility services aimed at and provided to meet Muslim tourists' experiences, needs, and desires, (Yahya, 2019). The concept of halal tourism first appeared in 1997. Mohsin and Ryan wrote a study, namely writing the Concept of Muslim-friendly attractions, during a visit to Australia from Malaysia and Indonesia (Ismail et al., 2019).

Commented [I10]: Pls check and recheck throughout the manuscript. There are some names of authors that should be written outside parentheses (if they are parts of sentence) or inside parentheses (if they are not part of the sentence).

Commented [I11]: Introduction should be closed by a statement of what previous research have analyzed, what this paper is about, and what it contributes to the existing literature.

Commented [I12]: The literature review is not adequate. It elaborates predominantly about definitions and concepts, not digging deeply on what the current studies have learned, what are the gaps that the authors may be able to bridge.

(Puad et al., 2016) defines halal tourism as Islamic tourism, and it can also be defined as tourism done primarily by Muslims, although it can include non-Muslims who are motivated to travel by Islam, which takes place in the Muslim world. The objectives are: first, the revival of Islamic culture and the spread of Islamic values; second, the economic benefits to the Islamic community; and third, strengthen the confidence, identity and Islamic belief to face negative stereotypes compared to other cultures and lifestyles.

Sharia tourism which is popularly interpreted as Halal tourism, is a tour in accordance with sharia principles (Majelis Ulama Indonesia, n.d.). Furthermore, (Anonymous, 2018) provides completeness signs with several halal tourism components, namely:

- Halal hotel: with key indicators of Islamic hotels including no alcohol, no gambling, etc.; Only halal food; Quran, prayer mats, and arrows indicating the direction of Mecca in every room; Beds and toilets are positioned not to face toward Mecca; prayer room; conservative staff clothing; Islamic funding; Separate recreational facilities for men and women.
- Halal Transportation (Airline): Key indicators of halal transportation include: cleanliness, non-alcoholic beverages, and publications in line with Islam.
- Halal Food Place: Food served in the restaurant must be halal. All animals must be slaughtered in accordance with Islamic principles. Alcoholic beverages should not be performed in this place.
- Halal Tour Packages: The contents of the tour package must be based on an Islamic theme. Islamic tour packages include visits to mosques, Islamic monuments and promotions and events during Ramadan.
- Halal Finance: The financial resources of hotels, restaurants, travel agents and airlines must be in accordance with Islamic principles. In general, Islamic finance requires participation in the sharing of profits and losses among all parties involved in this financing company. Islamic finance also prohibits interest.

Referring to the conclusion of (Kusumaningrum et al., 2017), from Korea's experience developing halal tourism, it can be concluded that South Korea's interest in building a Muslim-friendly country's image is 1) to increase public income and investment, 2) to look for alternatives to domestic market development so as not to depend on China as an export destination, and 3) to strengthen cooperation and diplomatic relations with Muslim countries, as a

geopolitical strategy. Likewise, socialization and implementation of the concept of halal tourism in Indonesia, which is successfully carried out, can establish the concept of halal tourism in halal tourism stakeholders, making the travel experience, especially for foreign tourists, memorable. The satisfaction of foreign tourists will strengthen the relationship between the tourism place and the country where tourists come from. The comfort and tourist experience can be helpful to invite investors.

Halal tourism policy is also a manifestation of tourism aimed at strengthening friendship between nations as one of the tourism destinations, (Santoso et al., 2020). The tourists from the Middle East is a prospect for potential tourists in the future, the level of shopping and travel outbound are quite high. Middle Eastern markets remain attractive to Indonesia because they have the potential to spend high quality. (Widagdyo, 2015) states that tourists from the Middle East vary significantly in terms of psychographic aspects. Several types and characteristics of tourists from the Middle East were identified, including Business people and professionals, Middle and Upper-Class Tourists, Youth and Students, and Traders.

It is necessary for all stakeholders to understand and socialize Sharia compliance practices with all aspects of tourism in the tourism competitiveness index. From the conclusion of some research findings, there is an opportunity for the local area and tourism stakeholders to create a halal tourism concept that all stakeholders can accept according to the context of the tourism object and its area.

Halal Tourism Development Strategy by Public Organizations

According to (Wegrich, n.d.), public organizations are part of an economic system controlled by national, state or provincial, and local governments. A public organization is a local government mandated by the Ministry of Tourism and Creative Economic to develop halal tourism.

Nowadays, Public Organizations have been enhanced by the concept of Reinventing Government, an effort to increase public sector productivity with 10 principles of reinventing government expressed by (Osbor & Gaebler, 1996) . According to (Wijayanto et al., 2013) there are still two implementations of reinventing government principles that have not been fulfilled, namely: a) Decentralized Government; b) Market-Oriented Government.

Provincial or Regency / City Governments who have established halal tourism as one of the destination development main icons are encouraged: a. To draft policies on halal tourism. b. To create a database to support the certification

of halal tourism products and businesses and the development of halal tourism, which can be accessed by halal tourism stakeholders, (Yahya, 2019). Thus, the Ponorogo Regency government can draw up regulations and policies in developing halal tourism. The emphasis on the regulation and policy accentuate halal tourism market orientation.

The explicit role of local governments in the concept and implementation of halal tourism will make regulations more acceptable and taking sides to the market. It is also profitable for halal tourism stakeholders to provide a high-value halal tourism experience among Muslim tourists. When halal tourism is carried on successfully, it will open great opportunities for the local area to get investors in other various business fields through halal tourism activities. The benefits of halal tourism can be a booster for local governments to develop with stakeholders.

Stakeholder Theory

According to (Freeman, 1984), A stakeholder is any group or individual who can influence or be influenced by the achievement of organizational goals. Stakeholders have diverse interests. Therefore they must be addressed and controlled by management. According to Freeman, the concept of "Stakeholder Management" refers to the need for organizations to manage relationships with specific stakeholder groups in an Action-oriented manner. This management core consists of 3 stages; Identify who the stakeholders are and what their interests are, understand how the organization's processes communicate with stakeholders and understand a series of transactions or bargains between the organization and its stakeholders.

The organization is said to have high or superior stakeholder management capabilities if it meets the following criteria: (Freeman, 1984)

- understanding the stakeholder map and the interests of each group,
- having a process which routinely has standard operating procedures for an organization to account for the groups and their interest.
- Implement a series of transactions or bargains to balance the interest of stakeholders to achieve organizational goals.

A stakeholder is divided into two categories: internal stakeholder within the organization and external, outside the organization. An external stakeholder is more difficult to identify its interests and influence in succeeding or disrupting the implementation of organizational performance achievement strategies. The nature of the relationship with the organization for stakeholders outside the organization is generally the involvement of stakeholders. This type of engagement, according

to (Bryson, 2004) was chosen from five approaches; providing transparent information, consulting for consideration, providing opportunities for employment, collaborating, empowering.

Stakeholder Concept

The company is founded by someone as a business pioneer with the initial capital he owns. Then, it develops in need of additional money, which involves investors who invest their capital in exchange for shares or company ownership. The company's strategy was originally structured with the principle of providing maximum profits to investors. Because the company is also required to be able to continue to operate and provide benefits in the long term, the company must also care about the business related to the company's operations either directly or indirectly, such as; raw material suppliers, product distributors, product selling agents, and creditors. To sum up, the stakeholder theory originated from this understanding.

The basic idea of stakeholder theory is quite simple. (Edward Freeman et al., 2007) state that understanding business means knowing how relationships between stakeholder groups work. The job of an executive or entrepreneur is to manage and form those relationships, which is termed as managing stakeholders—starting from helping to provide clarity to managers about the stakeholders' characteristics and behaviour in order to avoid mistakes in acting. Furthermore, it helps to clarify the relationships and contributions of stakeholders in achieving the company's objectives, making it easier to determine the scale of service priorities to stakeholders.

Program for Stakeholder

Strategies selected based on a strategic issue, then implemented by the organization, will be influenced by the organization's internal and external stakeholders. Stakeholder programs are not only accommodating stakeholder interests, but also must be able to support the organization strategic programs. (Edward Freeman et al., 2007), quoting Lorange, pointing out four strategic program foundations in connection with stakeholders: Existing programs for stakeholders; New programs for stakeholders; Programs to improve Current Operating Efficiency; Support Program for Other Stakeholder Relationships.

III. METHODOLOGY

The study approach is qualitative whose output produces a tourism development strategy from the stakeholder side. Data is compiled from interviews, photos, and other official documentation relevant to tourism conditions (Aziz et al., 2020). The data processing technique goes through a series of processes with focus group discussions (FGD) involving parties related to tourism in Ponorogo Regency. The object in question is the Tourism Office and destination managers in Ponorogo Regency (East Java) and related stakeholders.

IV. DISCUSSION

4.1. Halal Tourism Concept

The purpose of providing halal tourism for tourism managers is to introduce Islamic values and culture; economic benefit for Islamic society; (Puad et al., 2016). For tourists, religion is one of the crucial factors in the decision-making process of traveling; they also ensure the availability of Islamic attributes in the destination and service, (Suid et al., 2017).

The aim of halal tourism and the tourist interests to get entertainment and travel which is guaranteed halal are the main factors to make the concept of halal tourism in Indonesia. Understanding halal tourism can be widely accepted between tourists and tourist destination managers with stakeholders around it. However, it cannot only be approached by relying on the government's definition. According to (Awalia, 2017), in the theory of commodification, whoever is able to commodify discourse will get complete control over the object of his power. Understanding halal tourism dominated by the Government can not be separated from political interests and partisanship toward specific communities, which will cause jealousy and social conflict that will threaten the integrity and unity of the region. In turn, there can't be an equal understanding among stakeholders toward halal tourism.

The concept of halal tourism is still not the same. Each tourism doer has not found the same concept about the application of halal tourism. This can make the development of halal tourism difficult (Ishak, 2019). Efforts are needed to build the understanding dynamically among halal tourism stakeholders to provide halal tourism and have a halal tourism conscious attitude compactly.

The understanding of tourism stakeholders about tourism has become a mindset which is awakened with years of experience. Their understanding of halal tourism as a new theme requires a change in mindset. So that an interactive understanding is needed and built continuously between the concept of tourism

Commented [I13]: Pls be consistent in spacing

Pls explain the objective of this study. Who are the stakeholders? How many? Interviews with whom? About the photos, where they are from, or are they taken purposively for the sake of this study. What are "other official documents"? Who are "parties related to tourism"?

Methodology is very short and does not sufficiently explain the research method. It has no references. Which authors use similar methods? In which case? Why is this method selected? What are the advantages and drawbacks of such method?

For me the process of developing strategy is not clear. Pls clarify how many interviews have been done? How many FGDs? How long each of this FGD takes place? How many participants of the FGDs? Is there and contradictory arguments in the FGD? How to solve the conflicts? How was the conclusion drawn?

Commented [I14]: No results? Why do you jump to discussion. What to discuss when there is no result?

and various aspects of religion which is done together with halal tourism stakeholders.

As (Zarkasyi, n.d.) says that mindset is strong and its change can be sudden and transformative due to an event. An event that can trigger a change in mindset is an enormous event experienced by a person. That event may be awe-inspiring, so it can fundamentally change the beliefs or values in someone's mind. So understanding the concept of halal tourism is not enough to rely on socialization. Still, it must be followed by involvement to carry out activities together, which will form a memorable experience. Then intensive dialogue is conducted to be able to change the stakeholder's prejudice, value and belief.

Stakeholder theory aims to manage stakeholder interests to be in accordance with the company's strategic objectives in the long term. It will practically make the managers easier to behave, help clarify stakeholder relationships and contributions in achieving company goals, making managers easier to determine the scale of service priorities to stakeholders.

The difference in understanding the concept of halal tourism, which is often found, is the difference between tourism business doers and regulators in the Ministry of Tourism and Creative Industries and local governments. To build a common understanding, the two parties are directed to create the same views, even joining together in a group similar to a "corporation", and representing as a unit "corporation" for those outside them.

For halal tourism doers, the government initially, as an external stakeholder, functionally in the context of communication, turns into an internal stakeholder. For local governments, "a corporation" is a form of innovation that will give birth to a mindset of "thinking from within the company" or growing a mentality as a business doer. This mindset is necessary to be owned by all local governments. It is in line with strengthening the concept of reinventing government which in turn will result in policies and regulations readily accepted by halal tourism doers and supported by tourists also a strategic step that can be taken to build an understanding of halal tourism to the community and business doers are to carry out stakeholder empowerment in the framework of halal tourism development, as follows:

4.2. Halal Tourism Stakeholder Identification

Halal tourism has several stakeholders who have been involved and have not been involved in tourism in general. Ponorogo Regency has a cultural icon in the form of Reog Ponorogo, a traditional art known to foreign countries. In the world of

Commented [I15]: It is a literature review, not result/discussion

Education, there are 7 private universities, including Darussalam Gontor University, known among international academics and religious scholars. The Cultural Group and Religious Academics are influential in growing the aspiration of halal tourism stakeholders in Ponorogo.

Suppose halal tourism is able to drive the regional economy. In that case, halal tourism stakeholders are all actors of economic activities, even halal observers outside economic actors, such as universities or fatwa institutions. The stakeholders and their interest scores on halal tourism are: (Results of Focus Group Discussion and Interview with stakeholders)

Table 1: Stakeholder Interests and their Influence Scores on Halal Tourism

No	Stakeholder	Interest - Score	Quality	Score
1	Hotel	providing halal services without the loss of other consumers – 7	0,1	0,7
2	Restaurant/cafe	increased turnover, on top of the costs incurred for certification – 8	0,1	0,8
3	Food	increased turnover, on top of the costs incurred for certification – 8	0,1	0,8
4	Tourism Object	the attraction of the tourism object is still in demand by all tourists, although the theme is halal tourism - 9	0,15	1,35
5	Art, Culture	Creating halal events for tourists to enjoy, without overhauling indigenous art and culture – 7	0,1	0,7
6	Travel	halal tourism can increase the number of tourists who can be managed – 7	0,05	0,35
7	Religious University	developing the concept and science of halal tourism for academic purposes and in order to contribute in making policy and controlling its implementation – 8	0,1	0,8
8	Local government	developing halal tourism, to popularize and advance the area and increase regional revenues – 9	0,1	0,9

Commented [I16]: In the method, this scoring method was not mentioned at all.

No	Stakeholder	Interest - Score	Quality	Score
9	Society	given the opportunity to interact with foreign tourists, can contribute to halal tourism with the potential, not just as a passive supporter - 9	0,05	0,45
10	Tourist	enjoying friendly, the ease of worship and the clarity of the halal. - 10	0,15	1,5

Based on the table above, it can be sorted that stakeholder interests to be accommodated in halal tourism programs are: Tourist Attractions, Tourists, Local Government, Resto / Café, Food, Religious Colleges, Hotel and Cultural Art Activists, Communities and Travel Tours.

Accuracy in identifying stakeholders and uncovering their interests will make it easier for the tourism manager and local government to create stakeholder empowerment programs that are acceptable and useful in achieving the corporation's strategic goals. The realization of the concept of halal tourism agreed upon by all stakeholders is comprehensive and can be functioned in the long term, which can be the foundation of all halal tourism policies and regulations imposed.

4.3. Empowerment of Halal Tourism Stakeholder

The principle of the empowerment concept is the involvement of stakeholders proportionally, according to the level of influence on the operation of halal tourism business, it starts from the creation of halal tourism concept, regulation-making, and halal tourism operational activities. Halal tourism business managers hold empowerment of stakeholders in accordance with their interests and potential with local governments as a corporation. In the Bryson category, it can be done in several ways: providing clear information, consulting for consideration, providing opportunities for engagement, collaborating, and empowering.

The interest of these stakeholders can be addressed in their respective ways. In essence, it provides opportunities or memorable experiences to all stakeholders in halal tourism activities in proportion. Empowerment by direct involvement in halal tourism programs can inspire a synergy between stakeholders. Activities carried out together where intensive communication between stakeholders can eliminate stakeholder prejudice against the interests of local governments and form the correct mindset about halal tourism. The involvement of these stakeholders can be done in the following ways.

1. Tourism object manager; involved in drafting regulation, provided with information about existing regulation; given the opportunity to promote in all local government media and stakeholder media; collaborating with transportation managers for the promotion of tourism object; Synergizing between tourism object manager to provide a more memorable experience and a longer stay.
2. Tour package organizer, travel bureau; provided clear information about halal tourism; involved in promotion by the local government; managing synergy programs between tourism destination; given the opportunity to initiate a new business model of halal tourism.
3. Food and beverage business doer; Restaurant, food store, food maker; collaborating with tourism object manager; involved in the preparation of regulation by the local government; Empowered to be known by tourists.
4. Hotel Manager; involved in making rules; empowered to collaborate with universities; empowered to be able to provide the service for all tourists.
5. Tourist; promoted and virtualized as a tourist in ponorogo area, involved in providing a testimonial of halal travel experience; involved in the lover's community of halal tourism destination; appreciated and appreciated as a tourist, for example by pinned souvenir and other attributes.
6. College; provide religious, academic legitimacy about halal tourism; involved in policymaking and regulation; empowered in collaborating with halal tourism business doers.
7. The general public; empowered to uncover the tourism potential around it; given the opportunity to collaborate with tourism business manager; involved in the making of rules; Provided with information about halal tourism.
8. Local Government; can produce policy and regulation that regulate and succeed halal tourism; can carry out the concept of reinventing government by being allowed to be a catalyst in the empowerment of halal tourism stakeholders; playing a role in encouraging collaboration between stakeholders; involved in helping stakeholders to play a role in the halal tourism industry proportionally.

Commented [I17]: Pls use paragraph instead of numbering

Understanding of halal tourism can be realized in the company's attitude in managing stakeholder interest. They are building a shared understanding by running empowerment activities together in a participatory manner. Stakeholders are given the opportunity to carry out the necessary activities in the halal tourism

program to explore their understanding of halal tourism, to be further combined with the understanding of "a corporation". This is considered strategic to measure the extent to which stakeholders feel their interests are accommodated by "a corporation". Empowerment programs that can accommodate stakeholders' interests will facilitate the establishment of a shared understanding of halal tourism, which ultimately maintains cohesiveness in the implementation of halal tourism regulation and policy.

4.4. Strategic Program for Halal Tourism Stakeholder

The entire empowerment activity can also be carried out in a series of programs that are carried out continuously, for example:

1. Program for Stakeholders; This program is a strategy that a company undertakes to manage relationships with its stakeholder.
2. New program for stakeholders; a new program which changes the way stakeholder relationship is handled, due to the new halal tourism program. Halal tourism can create new stakeholder groups and reposition public tourism by redefining the old stakeholder holding program.
3. Program to Improve Current Operating Efficiency; strategic programming makes the company more efficient in halal tourism with new stakeholder groups: capital investment program or improvement study in the halal tourism service process by involving more skilled Human Resources.
4. Support Program for Other Stakeholder Relationships; Support program is formulated to help a manager achieves goals. The program is integrative, which create a more favourable managerial climate.

The four types of programs make stakeholders close to halal tourism managers and create harmonization and togetherness in the development of halal tourism. Stakeholder support morally in halal tourism is indispensable. (Vargas-sanchez et al., 2020), stated the need for extra efforts to socialize and promote idolatry in tourism. Socialization is directed to the appreciation of the spiritual dimension that focuses on the inner wellbeing of society, compared to other dimensions, such as health and ecology, because the experience of its spiritual nature can be considered as the most necessary condition to support efforts to position Indonesia as a halal tourist destination country.

It is impossible if it is only carried out by the company managing halal tourism destination itself; the participation and support of stakeholder and the community are needed. The local government, which has become a "corporation"

Commented [I18]: Minimize numbering

Commented [I19]: How did the authors conclude these strategic programs? They do not refer to any previous research and does not follow the mostly adopted procedures by identifying strengths, weaknesses, opportunities and challenges.

Commented [I20]: Pls use paragraph instead of numbering

with halal tourism managers, can be the initiator of this stakeholder empowerment program, bridging the communication of tourism managers with the community or newly identified stakeholders due to the existence of the halal tourism theme.

The core of the program is the empowerment of stakeholders to understand halal tourism as a direction for tourism development in the future by involving them directly in halal tourism activities, not just listening carefully. Empowerment is carried out together in a "corporation", namely halal tourism business managers and local government. With this strategy, it is expected that stakeholder feels proportionally involved, and able to create a synergy of new sustainable program, in the form of a special program for halal tourism.

Commented [I21]: The authors should discuss the findings by making relevant communications with the findings of previous studies, which is missing in this paper.

V. CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATION

1. The concept of halal tourism in accordance with the context of the area can be realized by minimizing differences in understanding of the concept of halal tourism between stakeholders. It starts with togetherness, especially between local government and tourism business doer in an organization that resembles a "corporation". The corporation is intended to avoid the dominance of commodification of halal tourism discourse by the government and tourism business doer unilaterally.
2. "Corporations" need to create an empowerment program for stakeholders to accommodate interests and behave toward stakeholders. This is expected to strengthen the understanding of halal tourism, which becomes the mindset of all stakeholders while inspiring the creation of a new business model of halal tourism by initiating collaboration and synergy between stakeholders.
3. Empowerment begins by identifying the existence, interest, and potential of stakeholders and measuring the influence level on halal tourism management operation. From the identification found six main stakeholders who are influential in halal tourism to be prioritized in empowerment program namely; Tourist Attraction Manager, Tourist, Local Government, Restaurant, Food manufacturer, Religious University
4. Stakeholder empowerment is carried out in a continuous program, including; providing transparent information, consulting for consideration, providing opportunities for engagement, collaborating, and empowering.

Commented [I22]: Pls no more numbering

5. In the framework of Reinventing Government, Local Government, which is incorporated in a "corporation" can proactively be a catalyst to build a tourism conscious attitude and developing an understanding of the concept of raw halal tourism and empowerment for halal tourism stakeholders in their area, market-oriented.

Commented [I23]: What are the limitations of this study. Pls provide recommendations for future research.

REFERENCES

- Alim, H. T., Riansyah, A. O., Hidayah, K., & Muslim, I. (2008). *YOGYAKARTA*. 1–8.
- Anonymous. (2018). *Strategic Roadmap For Development Of Islamic Tourism In OIC Member Countries*. The Statistical, Economic and Social Research and Training Centre for Islamic Countries (SESERIC).
- Awalia, H. (2017). Komodifikasi Pariwisata Halal NTB dalam Promosi Destinasi Wisata Islami di Indonesia. *Jurnal Studi Komunikasi (Indonesian Journal of Communications Studies)*, 1(1). <https://doi.org/10.25139/JSK.V1I1.64>
- Aziz, N. A. B. D., Muslichah, I., & Ngah, A. H. (2020). UNDERSTANDING FACTORS INFLUENCING COMMUNITY LIFE SATISFACTION TOWARDS SUSTAINABLE HERITAGE TOURISM DESTINATION : THE CASE OF YOGYAKARTA , INDONESIA. 15(1), 37–51.
- Bryson, J. M. (2004). *Strategic planning for public and nonprofit organizations: a guide to strengthening and sustaining organizational achievement-3rd ed*. John Wiley & Sons, Inc.
- C, M. H., & Prayag, G. (2020). *The Routledge Handbook of Halal Hospitality and Islamic Tourism*. Routledge.
- DW. (2019). *No Title*. <https://www.tempo.co/dw/1487/salah-paham-seputar-wisata-halal>
- Edward Freeman, R., Harrison, J. S., & C., A. W. (2007). *Managing for stakeholders: survival, reputation, and success*. Yale University Press.
- Freeman, R. E. (1984). *Strategic management, A Stakeholder Approach*. Pitman Books Limited.
- Hartono, A., & Wijayanto, @Punto. (2019). *Pedoman Pengembangan Wisata Sejarah dan Warisan Budaya*. KementerianPariwisata. moz-extension://7660aa79-e146-444d-8529-f6b01f5fda61/enhanced-reader.html?openApp&pdf=https%3A%2F%2Fwww.kemenparekraf.go.id%2Fasset_admin%2Fassets%2Fuploads%2Fmedia%2Fpdf%2Fmedia_1593566537_Buku_Pedoman_Pengembangan_Wisata_Sejarah_dan_Warisan_Budaya.pdf
- Ishak, A. (2019). PANDANGAN STAKEHOLDER PARIWISATA TENTANG HALAL. *Jurnal Ranah Komunikasi (JRK)*, 3, 69–81.
- Ismail, M. N., Othman, R., & Ismail, M. S. (2019). Halal tourism research

Commented [I24]: Some article titles are write in capital letters. Be consistent.

Alim, what is it? Book? Article?? Pls check n recheck the metadata.

MELENDELEY PLS

- bibliometric analysis in Scopus, ProQuest and Ebscohost / Mohd Nasir Ismail ...[et al.]. *Undefined*.
- Kusumaningrum, D. N., Fairuz, A. M., & Putri, E. P. (2017). *Trend pariwisata halal korea selatan*. 855–865.
- Majelis Ulama Indonesia. (n.d.). *Pedoman Penyelenggaraan Pariwisata Berdasarkan Prinsip Syariah*. 2016. Retrieved August 5, 2021, from <https://drive.google.com/file/d/0BxTl-INihFyzV0dPcEdtd0kwN2M/view?resourcekey=0-ZW0VKJGV2YqoVoRC4kuszg>
- Osbor, D., & Gaebler, T. (1996). *Mewirauahakan Birokrasi: (Reinventing Government), Mentransformasi Semangat Wirausaha Ke Dalam Sektor Publik*. Pustaka Binaman Pressindo.
- Prodjo, W. A. (2016). *No Title*. KOMPAS.Com. <https://travel.kompas.com/read/2016/08/06/170400727/Tiga.Hambatan.Pengembangan.Wisata.Halal.di.Indonesia>.
- Puad, A., Som, M., Masutani, S., & Ahmad, M. F. (2016). The Macrotheme Review A multidisciplinary journal of global macro trends The Growth of Muslim Friendly and Halal Tourism in Inbound and Outbound Travel Market. *The Macrotheme Review*, 5(5), 10–17.
- Salam Gateway. (2020). *State of the Global Islamic Economy 2020/21 Report*. <https://www.salaamgateway.com/specialcoverage/SGIE20-21>
- Santoso, L., Cahyani, Y. T., & Suryani, S. (2020). DILEMA KEBIJAKAN WISATA HALAL DI PULAU LOMBOK. *Jurnal Sosiologi Reflektif*, 15(1), 23–44. <https://doi.org/10.14421/JSR.V15I1.1968>
- Sapta Nirwandar. (2020). *Halal Tourism Itu Bukan Persoalan Agama an sich*. Bisnis Wisata.Co.Id. <https://bisniswisata.co.id/sapta-nirwandar-halal-tourism-itu-bukan-persoalan-agama-an-sich/>
- Satrian, E. D., & Faridah, H. D. (2018). *Wisata halal: perkembangan, peluang, dan tantangan*. 01(02), 32–43.
- Sayekti, N. W. (2019). *STRATEGI PENGEMBANGAN PARIWISATA HALAL DI INDONESIA HALAL TOURISM DEVELOPMENT STRATEGY IN INDONESIA Sektor pariwisata merupakan salah satu program prioritas pembangunan Kabinet Kerja 2015-2019 di bagi Indonesia yang memiliki keindahan alam dan kekayaan se*. 159–172.
- Sofyan, R., Ahmad, H., Rahtomo, W., Hidayat, N., Sari, C. A., Nursali, Y., Dewandaru, G., & Quraisy, M. (n.d.). *Laporan Perkembangan Pariwisata Ramah Muslim Daerah 2019-2020*. Komite Nasional Ekonomi dan Keuangan Syariah (KNEKS). <https://knks.go.id/storage/upload/1608113420-LaporanPerkembanganPariwisataRamahMuslimDaerah2019-2020.pdf>
- Suid, I. S., Ashikin, N., Nor, M., & Omar, H. (2017). *A Review on Islamic Tourism and the Practical of Islamic Attributes of Destination in Tourism Business*. 7(12), 255–269. <https://doi.org/10.6007/IJARBSS/v7-i12/3609>

- Vargas-sanchez, A., Hariani, D., & Sanchez, A. V. (2020). *Perceptions of Halal Tourism in Indonesia : Mental Constructs and Level of Support Perceptions of Halal Tourism in Indonesia : Mental Constructs and Level of Support*. 8(4).
- Wegrich, K. (n.d.). *public sector*. Encyclopedia Britannica. Retrieved July 25, 2021, from <https://www.britannica.com/topic/public-sector>
- Widagdyo, K. G. (2015). ANALISIS PASAR PARIWISATA HALAL INDONESIA. *Tauhidinomics: Journal of Islamic Banking and Economics*, 1(1), 73–80. <https://doi.org/10.15408/THD.V1I1.3325>
- Wijayanto, I. H., Suryono, A., & Sukanto. (2013). Pengembangan Potensi Pariwisata Dalam Perspektif Reinventing Government (Studi Di Dinas Kebudayaan Dan Pariwisata Kabupaten Lamongan). *Jurnal Administrasi Publik Mahasiswa Universitas Brawijaya*, 1(6), 1168–1173.
- Yahya, A. (2019). *Panduan Penyelenggaraan Pariwisata Halal*. Kementerian Pariwisata.
- Zarkasyi, M. R. (n.d.). *Entrepreneurship – Intrapreneurship, Untuk Kemandirian dan Kelestarian Bisnis*. UNIDA Gontor Press.

Article Assessment

Ekulibrrium : Jurnal Ilmiah Bidang Ilmu Ekonomi

Article Title: STRATEGIES FOR DEVELOPING HALAL TOURISM VIEWED FROM STAKEHOLDER THEORY: A CASE OF PONOROGO REGENCY

Review instructions:

1. Reviewers are requested to provide comments on the articles that request revision
2. Fill in the following form
3. Description of article score:
 - 0: Poor
 - 1: Fair
 - 2: Good
 - 3: Very Good
 - 4: Excellent

Article Variables	Description	Article Score				
Relevance	Topic Suitability of the article for publication	0	1	2	3	4
	<p>Comment</p> <p>It is within the journal scope.</p>					
Contributions	Quality articles in terms of ideas / innovation and authenticity (originality), novelty (novelty), and innovation (innovation)	0	1	2	3	4
	<p>Comment</p> <p>The paper says nothing about novelty.</p>					
Presentation Techniques						
Article organization	The language used, the clarity of the content of the article and understood by the reader	0	1	2	3	4
	<p>Comment</p> <p>The content is understandable, but the objectives and the methods are not adequate.</p>					
Abstract	Short, clear, complete, and interesting	0	1	2	3	4
	<p>Comment</p> <p>Too long, boring</p>					
	The accuracy of keyword selection	0	1	2	3	4

	Comment					
	Ok					
Preliminary	Clarity of background disclosure problems, differences with previous research, and contributions to be made	0	1	2	3	4
	Comment					
	The theoretical contribution is missing. The authors did not write anything about the uniqueness of this paper as compared to the previous ones. No research questions.					
Troubleshooting Methods / Approaches	Conformity of research design with title	0	1	2	3	4
	Comment					
	Research design is not clear					
Results and analysis	Analysis of results and sharpness (can help tables and images to facilitate understanding)	0	1	2	3	4
	Comment					
	Research design is not clear, so it is quite difficult to comprehend the flow of results and discussion.					
Conclusion	The essence of the findings of the research conducted and its presentation	0	1	2	3	4
	Comment					
	Conclusions should begin with the theoretical as well as practical contribution of the paper, short version of findings, limitation and recommendations for future research.					
	Enough to answer the research objectives	0	1	2	3	4
	Comment					
	There is no research questions in introduction. So it's quite difficult to draw a line from introduction to conclusion.					
Reference	References to novelty used, references to conformity given, procedures for reference and references to texts	0	1	2	3	4
	Comment					
	The authors used reference manager, but some metadata are not complete. So, pls check and recheck.					

	Sufficiency State of the Art Overview (maximum reference for the last 10 years) of previous research / journal articles	0	1	2	3	4
	Comment Yes					
	Compatibility writing bibliography uses the APA 6th Edition (American. Format Psychological Association).	0	1	2	3	4
	Comment Yes					

3. Bukti Konfirmasi Artikel Accepted (6 September 2022)

The screenshot shows a Gmail interface on a Windows desktop. The browser address bar displays the URL: <https://mail.google.com/mail/u/0/#search/Ekuilibrum/FMfcgzGqQSJFxtGVsFCKHJfMqvJfFrpr>. The email subject is "[Ekuilibrum] Editor Decision". The sender is Rochmat Aldy Purnomo (ojsumop1999@gmail.com) to MUHAMMAD, me, Fajar. The email content is in Indonesian and discusses the acceptance of 8 articles in the journal "Ekuilibrum: Jurnal Ilmiah Bidang Ilmu Ekonomi Volume 17 No 2 (2022): September". It includes instructions for authors who have been accepted to pay and those who have not.

[Ekuilibrum] Editor Decision External Inbox x

Rochmat Aldy Purnomo <ojsumop1999@gmail.com>
to MUHAMMAD, me, Fajar

Translate to English

Assalamu'alaikum Warahmatullahi Wabarakatuh

Selamat pagi, berikut kami sampaikan 8 artikel yang lolos terbit di **Ekuilibrum: Jurnal Ilmiah Bidang Ilmu Ekonomi Volume 17 No 2 (2022): September**.

Kepada Bapak/Ibu author yang lolos kami ucapkan selamat dan dimohon segera melakukan pembayaran serta mengirimkan bukti transfer via WA 08991083050. LoA akan diberikan setelah proses pembayaran selesai. Selanjutnya untuk proses editing dan sebagainya mohon menunggu informasi dari kami.

Kepada Bapak/Ibu author yang belum lolos, kami ucapkan terimakasih banyak atas partisipasinya, kami berharap Bapak/Ibu dapat mengikuti penerbitan edisi selanjutnya



DECISION LETTER

No. 01.002/EKU/IX/2022

Ekuilibrium: Jurnal Ilmiah Bidang Ilmu Ekonomi, Economic Faculty of Universitas Muhammadiyah Ponorogo has decided that the names of articles below has been reviewed and will be published in Vol. 17 No. 2 (2022): September.

NO.	AUTHOR/S	TITLE
1	Evi Gravitiani, Ika Alicia Sasanti, Rebecca Cindy Sartika, Malik Cahyadin	The role of stakeholders in sustainable tourism using Mactor Analysis: evidence from Kragilan's top selfie, Magelang Indonesia
2	Rochmat Aldy Purnomo, Oksana Malynka	Sustainable business development via applying an online business model for gaining benefit in economics, education, and social network
3	Lyna Latifah, Nurdian Susilowati, Muhammad Noor Ardiansah, Tusyanah Tusyanah, Muhammad Syukri Abdullah	Social media networking and knowledge sharing in increasing innovation and MSME's growth: based on the theory of communication visibility
4	Dwi Prasetyani, Amelia Choya Tia Rosalia, Rizky Nur Ayuningtyas Putri	Sociopreneurship and philanthropy during Pandemic COVID-19: a matchmaker idea
5	Heri Wijayanto, Alip Sugianto, Ekapti Wahjuni Djuwitaningsih	Evaluation of the success of the digital marketing implementation of the Reyog Ponorogo equipment with the Wijayanto information's system success model approach, and millennial culture as a moderating variable
6	Muhammad Safar Nasir, Mahrus Lutfi Adi Kurniawan	Credit guarantee the national Economic Recovery Program (PEN) for MSMEs
7	Catarina Wahyu Dyah, Endang Mulyani, Afriyanti Afriyanti, Hadi Cahyono	Analysis of the impact of tourism on economic growth of Gunung Kidul District
8	Muhammad Ridlo Zarkasy, Dhika Amalia Kurniawan, Fajar Surya Ari Anggara	Stakeholders Approach in Halal Tourism Development Strategy: A Case Study in Ponorogo District

To develop our management system and cover publications cost, we need your donation before publishing your article. Article processing charge can be transfer to bank account below:

Author fees : Rp 1.500.000
Bank : BNI Ponorogo
Account name : Ardyan Firdausi Mustoffa
Account Number : 1251729585

Thank you.

Regards,
Editor in Chief