

CHAPTER 1

INTRODUCTION

A. Background of Study

The problem of 'secularism' and 'secularization' grown first in the Western civilization. Secular, alongside liberal, described as a movement to free the civilians from the power of Church, which has been strong since the start of Middle Ages¹. There are at least three factors that forced the West to embrace secular and liberal worldview: *First*, Historical trauma regarding to the domination of The Church in Middle Ages, *second*, the problem regarding to the codex of Bible, *third*, the problem regarding to the Christian theological doctrines. These factors are intertwined between them and produced the secular-liberal worldview in the Western civilization and thoughts².

The discourse in the problem of secularism and secularization has not faded until today. The West -which had adopted secularism in their worldview- is trying to persuade The Muslim World to embrace it. The most popular example is what has the Ottoman Empire done when they start to crumble after defeat against Russia in 1774 and against France in 1798. They issued a series of program called '*tanzimat*' which contains some controversy, such as the dissolvment of Jannisaries and abolition of *dzimmi* status from non-muslim civilians³. Furthermore, the dissolvment of the Ottoman Empire and declaration of Republic Turkiye by Mustafa

UNIVERSITAS DARUSSALAM GONTOR

¹ Adian Husaini, *Wajah Peradaban Barat* (Depok: Gema Insani Press, 2005) p. 29

² *Ibid.*

³ Syamsuddin Arif, *Islam dan Diabolisme Intelektual* (Jakarta: INSISTS, 2018) p.70

Kemal Ataturk brought more secularization and worse, as he declares secularization as one of his 'six arrows' to deislamize the country⁴. Although this movement originally implemented to chase The West advance, Turkiye under secular ideology has not reached the desired goal.

Other examples of secularization effect in Muslim World are the emergence of liberal and secular Muslim scholars, which persuades to abolish the Islamic law and voted towards the Western law and thoughts. Among those scholars are Qasim Amin (1863-1908) who declared that Islamic law has prevented the advance of Muslim World, 'Ali 'Abdur-Raziq who declared the separation between religion and politics, also Taha Husayn (1889-1976) who broaden that separation to the field of education and other scholars⁵.

In Indonesia, the idea of secularization between religion and politics has shown before its proclamation, as some founding fathers pushed nationalism as ideological basis while others desired to see Islam as ideological basis⁶. This debate heated until reached its peak during the Consistent Assembly Meeting in 1955. But this movement become more popular since Nurcholish Madjid delivered his speech in 1970. In his speech, Madjid accused the desire to form an Islamic country by Islamic parties for the stagnancy of Muslims, As those parties cannot form a positive image of Islam but vice versa. Then, Madjid delivered his idea to

⁴ *Op.cit*, p.71.

⁵ *Op.cit*, p. 73-74.

⁶ *Op.cit*, p.75.

separate both politics and Islam with his infamous jargon: '*Islam yes, Partai Islam no!*'⁷.

After his declaration, his idea of secularization received both positive and negative feedbacks from many scholars. The government itself agreed with Madjid's idea, but not for old scholars. Some names among these ranks are Mohammad Rasjidi, Mohammad Natsir, H. Abdul Malik Karim Amrullah, Endang Saifuddin Anshari and Abdul Qadir Djaelani⁸. One of the most active to deliver his critiques towards that idea in particular is Mohammad Rasjidi. Even Rasjidi writes a particular response against the idea of secularization.

In addition to this problem, Madjid argues that his idea of secularization is parallel with Islamic monotheism in form of desacralization; stripping the temporal values from the transcendental ones⁹. Madjid also stated that secularization is necessary to reform the Islamic society. In contrast, Rasjidi rejects that idea, and stated that the reformation should be based on Islamic values, and not from Western Values. The receptions towards those ideas are different, as Madjid received more recognition as it seems giving answer towards the modernization problem. In contrast, because Rasjidi and other scholars' responses only delivered for conservating old thoughts and values, and mostly not giving answer for modernization as Madjid's idea¹⁰.

⁷ Tiar Anwar Bachtiar, *Pertarungan Pemikiran Islam di Indonesia* (Jakarta: Pustaka Al-Kautsar, 2017) p.44

⁸ Tiar Anwar Bachtiar, *Ibid.* p.95.

⁹ Nurcholish Madjid, *Islam Kemodernan dan Keindonesiaan*, (Bandung: Mizan Pustaka, 2008) p.250.

¹⁰ Tiar Anwar Bachtiar, *Op.cit.* p.94-95

From this point, it adds interest to study about them, to find stronger idea from both: is secularization a necessity for modernization, or it is not.

Furthermore, both of them are among prominent scholar in their era. What follows below are short expressions about Rasjidi and Madjid.

Mohammad Rasjidi (birth: Saridi) was an Indonesian scholar, also politician. He was born in Kotagede, Yogyakarta at 20 May 1915. His parents are muslim, but not practising Islamic shari'at. These people known as *Islam Abangan*¹¹. Saridi have studied in numerous institutions, namely *Kweekschool* Muhammadiyah in Ngabean¹², Al-Irsyad in Lawang¹³, Darul Ulum in Cairo and University of Cairo itself¹⁴, and Sorbonne Universite. He was appointed as minister of religion, then as Indonesian ambassador for Egypt, then for Iran and Afghanistan, and other strategic positions in government. As a scholar, he was a member of *Rabihah 'Alam Islami*, also a lecturer in IAIN, and a Professor of Islamic Law in University of Indonesia. Among his writings are *Koreksi Terhadap Drs. Nurcholish Madjid tentang Sekularisme, Filsafat Agama, Empat Kuliyah Agama Islam di Perguruan Tinggi*, and more.

Nurcholish Madjid was also an Indonesian scholar. Madjid was born at 17 March 1939 in Jombang. Unlike Rasjidi, his family was from *Nahdlatul Ulama*, but affiliated to *Masyumi*. Madjid was an alumni of Darul Ulum in Jombang -better known as Rejoso-, also of Darussalam Gontor Modern Islamic Institution in Ponorogo, IAIN Syarif Hidayatullah in

¹¹ Endang Basri Ananda (ed.), *70 Tahun Prof. Dr. H. M Rasjidi* (Jakarta: Harian Umum Pelita, 1985.) p. 4.

¹² *Ibid*, p.5

¹³ *Ibid*, p. 6

¹⁴ *Ibid*, p. 15-16.

Jakarta, and University of Chicago¹⁵. As a scholar, Madjid has several books, namely *Islam, Kemodernan, dan Keindonesiaan; Cita-Cita Politik Islam Era Reformasi; Pintu-Pintu Menuju Tuhan*, and many more.

From those short expressions, the researcher found another point of interest. Both of Rasjidi and Madjid have studied in West. But, it seems that they have different approach to the western thoughts they got there. One of those thoughts is secularization, which will be discussed within this study.

Based on points above, the researcher gives boundaries in his research. This research will conduct a study in the idea of secularization from both scholar; while comparing and contrasting them with other thoughts, in order to make better understanding from those.

B. Problem Formulation

From some description explained in introduction, the main issues in this thesis are:

1. What is secularization according to Nurcholish Madjid?
2. What are critiques of Mohammad Rasjidi towards Madjid's idea of secularization?

C. Purpose of Study

Every research has several objectives that useful and used as guidelines to strengthen the depth of data analysis. In this research, they are:

¹⁵ Budhy Munawar-Rachman, *Membaca Nurcholish Madjid*. (Jakarta: Democracy Project Yayasan Abad Demokrasi, 2011). p.2.

1. To know secularization according to Nurcholish Madjid.
2. To know Mohammad Rasjidi's critiques towards Madjid's idea of secularization.

D. Significance of Study

From the title stated above, this research is expected to provide the following significance:

1. Theoretical Significance

Theoretically, this research is expected to contribute ideas and insights to students and broaden it. Also, it's expected to provide scientific contributions and treasures of academic world about the idea of secularization in general, and about Nurcholish Madjid and Mohammad Rasjidi's views in secularization in particular.

2. Practical Significance

This research is expected to provide accurate information that can be used as a reference in writing a scientific paper, also provide an alternative view regarding to the case of secularization.

E. Literature Review

1. Muniroh, *Pemikiran Prof. Dr. Mohammad Rasjidi Tentang Sekularisme*¹⁶ (Yogyakarta: Universitas Islam Negeri Sunan Kalijaga, 2005). Undergraduate thesis. In her thesis, its researcher discussed about the background of secularization movement in The West, definition of secularism and secularization in Mohammad Rasjidi's view, and its implication.

¹⁶ Thoughts of Prof. Dr. Mohammad Rasjidi About Secularism

This thesis confirms Rasjidi's refusal towards the idea of secularization. It gives a positive implication in moral scope and axiological critiques. In the other side, Rasjidi's refusal denies the contribution of religion for the constant-changing world. This thesis focuses on Rasjidi's view only, not discussing Madjid's ideas of secularization any further. Thus, in this study, the writer shall include both views while trying to make a more focused conclusion.

2. Fajar Romadlon At-Tuhry, *Al-Qur'an dan Sekularisasi: Studi Kritis Atas Penafsiran Nurcholish Madjid*¹⁷. (Yogyakarta: Universitas Islam Negeri Sunan Kalijaga, 2015). Undergraduate thesis. This thesis discusses about Madjid's approach in understanding verses of al-Qur'an, as basis for his idea of secularization. This thesis uses the descriptive analysis method, with historic and hermeneutic approach. This thesis concludes that secularization -according to Madjid's understanding of some verses- aims to emphasize the importance of the present life, but not denying the afterlife like the secular view. In addition, this implicates towards the existence of inclusive theology which includes most of religion, and refusal of the Islamic State. This thesis mainly focused in describing Madjid's interpretation of some verses of al-Qur'an, and not using the philosophical approach. This study will use the philosophical approach in Madjid's idea, while not abandoning his interpretation. In addition, this study will

¹⁷ Al-Qur'an and Secularization: A Critical Study of Nurcholish Madjid's Interpretation

provide Rasjidi's argumentation to reject Madjid's interpretation.

3. Dessy Permata Sari Sinaga, *Sekularisasi Menurut Nurcholish Madjid Argumentasi Filosofis Teologis*¹⁸ (Medan: Universitas Islam Negeri Sumatera Utara, 2019). Undergraduate Thesis. In her thesis, its researcher discusses about Nurcholish Madjid's idea of secularization, in the theological-philosophical scope. This thesis confirms that Madjid distinguished between secularism and secularization. Furthermore, this thesis confirms that Madjid himself said that his idea of secularization is used in sociological field. This thesis focused in describing Madjid's idea, and not discussing Rasjidi's view, neither criticize it. Therefore, the writer shall provide Rasjidi's critiques towards this idea of secularization.
4. Imam Fauroni, *Sejarah Pemikiran H.M Rasjidi: Filsafat Agama (1915-2001 M)*¹⁹ . (Surabaya: Universitas Islam Negeri Sunan Ampel, 2019). Undergraduate thesis. This thesis discusses about ideas of Rasjidi in general, using philosophical approach and critical theory. In his thesis, the writer mentions Rasjidi's refutation towards Madjid's idea of secularization. This thesis does not explain about it in detail, but focused more in describing the history of Rasjidi. The writer aims to conduct his study in his particular aspect, namely his critiques towards secularization.

¹⁸ Secularization According To Nurcholish Madjid: Philosophical-Theological Argumentations

¹⁹ The History of H.M. Rasjidi's Thoughts: The Philosophy of Religion (1915-2001 M)

By this review, this study shall offer novelties. This study will use philosophical approach to describe Mohammad Rasjidi's critiques in his particular idea -namely secularization-, while providing Nurcholish Madjid's idea of secularization. By this, the writer aims to reach a comprehensive view of that idea as a result of his study.

F. Theoretical Framework

This study uses the philosophical approach. Philosophy in general is a discipline that discusses the essence of everything, by applying scientific procedure -which is, logical and analytical methods- while utilizing valid reasoning materials and results²⁰. More specifically, philosophy can be defined either as a consistent system of thought in a certain extent or as a method of thought which has following characters: pursuing fundamental ideas, creating a critical thought, and upholding intellectual freedom²¹.

Thus, the philosophical approach itself is an approach that using ratio as the measure of truth²². In practical field, this approach is used to observe a problem in philosophical scope, and tries to solve that particular problem using a speculative analysis²³. The goal of using this approach is

²⁰ Haidar Bagir, *Buku Saku Filsafat Islam*. (Bandung: Mizan Pustaka, 2005) p.38.

²¹ M. Amin Abdullah, *Rekonstruksi Metodologi Studi Agama dalam Masyarakat Multikultural dan Multireligius*, Academic speech in The Appointment of Professor at UIN Sunan Kalijaga Yogyakarta, 13 May 2000, in Mohammad Muslih, *Filsafat Ilmu: Kajian atas Asumsi Dasar, Paradigma, dan Kerangka Teori Dasar Ilmu Pengetahuan*. (Yogyakarta: LESFI, 2019.) p. 2.

²² Koko Abdul Kodir, *Metodologi Studi Islam*. (Bandung: Pustaka Setia, 2014.) p. 116.

²³ *Ibid*, p. 130.

finding a connection between the theological problem and scientific problem, by introducing wisdom from both.²⁴

Secularization -along with secularism- was born inside the Western civilization as response to the hegemonic reign of the Church²⁵. Both of these terms share a same root from Latin, *saeculum*, which means 'the present age'²⁶. This word also used to refer 'the world', beside the other term *mundus* (Space)²⁷. Then, there are two words used to refer 'the world', *saeculum* and *mundane*. According to Cox, this ambivalence is a result from how the Hebrews and the Greeks see the reality: Hebrews tend to see the reality from the scope of time, and Greeks tend to see it from the scope of space. In the end, the Hebrews prevailed, mediated through early Christians, and the perception of reality was 'temporalized'²⁸. As the result, the meaning of *saeculum* becomes wider, occupying both meaning of itself and *mundus*²⁹. Now, *saeculum* refers to both 'time and space'. Hence, *saeculum* means 'present' in the scope of time, and 'the world' with respect to space³⁰.

Some Western scholars distinguish between secularism and secularization. They argue that secularism is an ideology, but not secularization. Secularization -for them- is a natural process in the history

²⁴ *Loc.Cit.*

²⁵ Adian Husaini, *Op.Cit.* p. 29.

²⁶ Harvey Cox, *The Secular City: Secularization and Urbanization in Theological Perspective* (New York: The Macmillan Company, 1967), 16.

²⁷ *Ibid.*

²⁸ *Ibid.* p.23.

²⁹ *Ibid.*

³⁰ Syed Muhammad Naquib al-Attas, *Islam dan Sekularisme*, Kuala Lumpur: RZS-CASIS, HAKIM. 2021. p. 30.

of humanity. What follows below are taken from Syed Muhammad Naquib al-Attas.

Al-Attas affirms the root of word 'secularism' that Cox stated in his work: the Latin word *saeculum*, which means 'here and now'. Al-Attas also cited Cox definition about secularization, which derived from Van Peursen and Bonhoeffer. As cited by Cox, Van Peursen defines secularization as *the deliverance of man first from religious and then from metaphysical control over his reason and his language*³¹. Also, Cox cited from Bonhoeffer that *Secularization is man turning his attention away from worlds beyond and toward this world and this time*³². The West assumes that secularization is a historical process that cannot be undone, which liberating people and culture from religion and other closed metaphysical worldview³³.

The integral components of secularization -according to al-Attas- are: disenchantment of nature, desacralization of politics, and deconsencration of values. The first part separates the role of religion and metaphysical realm over this natural world. The second means abolition of sacral legitimation of political power and authority. The third component means rendering transient and relative all cultural creations and every value system -including religion- so that it can be open to change.³⁴

In this study, the researcher will analyze secularization from both views using philosophical approach. The researcher uses this particular

³¹ Harvey Cox, *Op.cit.* p.2. see also Al-Attas, *Ibid.* P.31.

³² Cox, *Ibid.*

³³ Al-Attas, *Op.cit.* P. 32.

³⁴ *Ibid*, p. 32-33.

approach, as two of the characters of philosophy itself are fundamental and critical. By using philosophical approach, this study is going to draw the essence of Rasjdi's critiques.

G. Methods of Study

The research method is a scientific method carried out by a researcher to obtain data to be used to obtain research results by what is intended by the researcher and can also be used for certain things. Conducting must be based on accurate, rational, and empirical data, because accountable research is based on reality. Therefore, what most be considered in scientific research is the scientific method, data and its sources, purpose, and also usability.

1. Type of Research

To conduct research, it is necessary to prepare the construction of research theory and advance and must know the type of research used for collecting data. This research itself includes in library research. In library research, the researcher uses written materials in several forms of literature such as al-Qur'an, books, articles, and other documents.

Literature research is a data collection technique that has a wider scope than field research because it has no boundaries of time and space. In addition, this type of research can be conducted through internet. However, it is important to know the media and know the administration system of the sources, in order to clarify everything about data sources, because not all documents are credible³⁵.

³⁵ Sugiyono, *Metode Penelitian Kuantitatif, Kualitatif dan R&D*. (Bandung: Alfabeta, 2019). p.315

There are three steps to collect data. First, inventory. In this step, the researcher conducts a wide and deep research about the thoughts and ideas of the certain figure, in order to precisely describe it. This step conducted by literature research. Second, critical evaluation. From the self-conducted research, the researcher compares between the ideas of corresponding figure and the other scholars thought about it. By this, the strength and weakness from those will be shown clearly. Third, synthesis. This step conducted to create a synthesis from those thoughts, which includes the appropriate elements and eliminates the inappropriate elements³⁶.

2. Data Analysis Methods

Data analysis method is collecting and arranging the data systematically from interviews, field notes, and documentation, by organizing the data in categories, then classifying them, conducting synthesis, marking the ideas and taking conclusion from them³⁷.

This study uses two methods: Analytic Method and Critique Method. The first one is a method to research a group of people, condition of an object, system of thought, or series of events in present to make a systematic, factual, and accurate description of the facts, characteristics, and relationships between phenomena in order to research particular problem.³⁸

The first is analytic method. With this method, the researcher tries to analyze the ideas and its deviated effect in communities, then draw

³⁶ Syahrin Harahap, *Studi Tokoh Dalam Bidang Pemikiran Islam*. (Medan: IAIN Press, 1995). p. 16-17.

³⁷ Sugiyono, *Op.cit.* p.320.

³⁸ Heinz Frick, *Pedoman Karya Ilmiah*. (Yogyakarta: Kanisius, 2008) p.24

conclusion from the particular problem. There are four stages of the analytic method, namely domain analysis, taxonomic analysis, comprehensive analysis and discovering cultural theme or theme analysis. The brief explanation is as below:

First, domain analysis is used to make a general and comprehensive picture of the research object or the social condition under the particular study. In this stage, the researcher gives general questions and inquiries to find many domains or categories. Therefore, this analysis will achieve a general description of the object under study, throughout this description is not in detail. Then, this result will be used as basis for further research³⁹.

Second, taxonomic analysis is used to give a clearer picture of the research object. It is obtained through focused and in-depth observation. The result can be expressed in box diagram, lines and dots diagram or in an outline⁴⁰.

Third, Comprehensive analysis is used to find specific characters in each domain throughout contrasting elements in each. By this stage, many specific dimensions between each element should be found⁴¹.

Fourth, cultural theme analysis is used to discover the connection between domains. That connection should be basis for constructing the research object or social condition in clearer picture.

³⁹ Sugiyono, *Op.cit.* p 333

⁴⁰ *Ibid*, p 339.

⁴¹ *Ibid*, p 342.

The second method, namely the critique method is used to assess both strengths and weaknesses of an idea. In an intellectual research, critiques also means to examine carefully and thoroughly in addition to consider strengths, weaknesses, the logical relationship, meaning and significance of study, and evaluation process that carried out objectively and critically on the research reports contents used as a scientific study.⁴²

3. Data Collection Methods

To reach the scientific truth in this discussion, the researcher uses library research, and conducting his research within books. Then, the books used in this research are classified into primary sources and secondary sources. The primary sources are:

1. *Koreksi Terhadap Drs. Nurcholis Madjid Tentang Sekularisasi* by Mohammad Rasjidi, Jakarta: Bulan Bintang, 1972. This book discusses Rasjidi's critiques towards Madjid's idea of secularization. This book also contains the transcript from Majid's infamous speech about secularization. Then, the researcher uses this book to conduct the research in both Madjid's idea and Rasjidi's critiques.
2. *Islam, Kemodernan, dan Keindonesiaan* by Nurcholish Madjid, Bandung: Mizan, 1994 (7th edition). This book is compilation of Nurcholish Madjid's articles and speeches. Therefore, the researcher uses this book to conduct the research in Madjid's idea of secularization.

⁴² C.Forchuck and J. Roberts, 'How to critique qualitative research articles'. *Canadian Journal of Research*, 25 (4). N.d. p. 47-55.

Beside those primary books, the researcher also will conduct his research in the secondary sources. The secondary sources are scholars' thought regarding this topic, beside Mohammad Rasjidi and Nurcholish Madjid. These sources will serve as supporting data in this study.

